Memorandum

To: Regional Director, Region Five

From: Acting Chief Architect

Subject: Historic Structures Report, Part I, Amended Administrative Data Section, McIlvaine House, Independence

The Historic Structures Report, Part I, Amended Administrative Data Section, McIlvaine House, Independence National Historical Park, has been reviewed by the interested Divisions in the Washington Office and is recommended for approval.

Robert E. Smith
Acting Chief Architect

Copy to: Chief, EODC (2)
Supt., Independence
Region Five  
143 South Third Street  
Philadelphia 6, Pa.  

February 26, 1960

Memorandum

To: Superintendent, Independence National Historical Park  
From: Regional Director  
Subject: Amended Administrative Data Section for Historic Structures Report, Part I, McIlvaine House.

We recommend the subject report to your approval.

(Sgd.) Ronald F. Lee

Ronald F. Lee  
Regional Director

In duplicate

Copy to: Director  
Chief, EODC  
Operations Division  

MHNelligan/cp

General  
Daily  
Area
McIlvaine House
AMENDED ADMIN. DATA SECTION

INTERPRETATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Info</th>
<th>OPERATIONS</th>
<th>Act</th>
<th>Initial and Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nat. Hist.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architect</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>WZC 1/18/60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publ.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sec'y.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admin, data</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OPERATIONS: 1/18/60

ASSISTANT REGIONAL DIRECTOR

Recommend approval

REGIONAL DIRECTOR

COMMENTS DUE (SUPT) JAN. 25
Region Five
143 South Third Street
Philadelphia 6, Pa.

January 15, 1960

Memorandum

To: Director

From: Regional Director

Subject: Amended Administrative Data Section for Historic Structures Report, Part I, McLlvaine House, Independence MHP

Attached for your review are two copies of an Administrative Data Section, Part I, for the subject building revised as of December 11, 1959. To facilitate review comparison with the Administrative Data Section originally submitted, it is suggested that the revised section be inserted in your bound copy of the report.

In accordance with established procedure, comments should be submitted to the Superintendent, Independence National Historical Park, no later than January 25.

(Sgd.) Ronald F. Lee
Ronald F. Lee
Regional Director

In duplicate

Attachments

Copy to: Chief, EODC, w/attachment
Supt., Independence

MHNelligan/cp

General
Daily
Area
Operations Division
Memorandum

To: Regional Director, Region V

From: Superintendent, Independence NHP

Subject: Amended Administrative Data Sections for Historic Structures Reports, Parts I, on Second Bank of the United States, McIlvaine House, and Kid Houses

In line with our memorandum of October 13, 1959, subject: "Development - Park Building," we submit herewith amended Administrative Data Sections for the Historic Structures Reports indicated above. With respect to the Second Bank of the U. S., we are also submitting Furnishings and Exhibition Data Section together with new Table of Contents. Please have one set of these inserted in place of the present sheets in your copies of the reports and forward the remainder to WASO and EODC for similar handling and review.

In your comments on my memorandum dated October 23, you have indicated concurrence in these proposals.

M. O. Anderson
Superintendent

Enclosures
Memorandum

To: Superintendent, Independence National Historical Park

From: Regional Director

Subject: Historic Building Survey Report, McIlvaine House

Like the others on the several Walnut Street Houses, this is an excellent report.

We are pleased to approve it, with one reservation: namely, that the proposed use for an architectural branch museum be further studied to define more precisely just how such a branch museum will assist in presenting this aspect of the park story, how much of the building will be used for exhibit purposes (the first floor only, perhaps), what space will be required to house the architectural study collection (and what will this collection presumably consist of and for what purposes will it be gathered), and how much space will be available for other purposes, such as drafting rooms for the Park architectural staff. Since development of the Walnut Street group of buildings may be not far distant, it is not too soon in our opinion to consider what may be termed a "branch museum prospectus" for this structure. This should be adequate, but as brief as possible.

Please let us know by what date such a prospectus could be prepared.

(Sgd.) Daniel J. Tobin

Daniel J. Tobin
Regional Director

In duplicate

Copy to: Director
Chief, EODC

MHNelligan/cp
General
Daily
Area
Operations (att. Mr. Nelson)
Memorandum

To: Director
From: Regional Director
Subject: Historic Building Survey Report, McIlvaine House, Independence National Historical Park

In accordance with the procedure outlined in FO-11-56 dated February 16, 1956, attached for your consideration is the Historic Building Survey Report for the McIlvaine House, Independence National Historical Park, prepared by Superintendent M. O. Anderson and his staff. By copy of this memorandum, we are forwarding a copy of the report to EODC for review and comment.

The report should be reviewed by no later than May 5. Our comments will follow.

(Sgd.) Daniel J. Tobin
Daniel J. Tobin
Regional Director

In duplicate

Attachment

Copy to: Supt., Independence
Chief, EODC (w/c report)

MHNelligan/cp
General
Daily
Area
Operations (att. Mr. Nelson)
INDEPENDENCE NATIONAL HISTORICAL PARK

Historic Building Survey Report - McIlvaine House

Interpretation

A good report. Would prefer to be more detailed. Need detail to support interpretation.

Barnes
Gotter

Operations


Assistant Regional Director

OK for the moment. I suggest that

Skipton prepare a "Use Plan." I want a clear plan for the future.

Regional Director

It strikes me that architectural history is extraneous to the

purpose of the park. It is not part of a federal building program. The same thing

is proposed on the Navy Yard for the same purpose. Why don't we try to do

it more directly? I want a plan to show the public.

RETURN TO INTERPRETATION BY May 2.

Report on Kirk houses is due within week.

Secretary

Recommending demolition. Need an

approval and preliminary report for filing with Interior

Director.

In charging such a decision to proceed with

whole block proposals to see at once.
MEMORANDUM

To: Regional Director, Region Five

From: Superintendent, Independence NHP

Subject: Historic Building Report for the McIlvaine House

In accordance with your memorandum dated February 15, 1957, we are herewith transmitting in triplicate for your review the historic building report for the McIlvaine House.

M. O. Anderson
Superintendent

Enclosures: 3 copies
SIGNATURE SHEET

RECOMMENDED

Director
Date

Regional Director
Date

Chief, Eastern Office, Div. of Design & Construction
Date

APPROVED

Superintendent
Date
Historic Building Survey

on

McIlvaine House

in

Independence National Historical Park


Prepared by

Staff

Independence National Historical Park

Philadelphia, Pennsylvania


April, 1938
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I. ADMINISTRATIVE DATA
Section 1. The Building (Name, No., etc.)
Section 2. Proposed Use of Structures and Justification
Section 3. Provision for Operating the House
Section 4. Preliminary Estimate of Cost for Rehabilitating the Structure and Grounds

CHAPTER II. HISTORICAL DATA
Section 1. Structural History from Documentary Sources
Section 2. Historical Associations
Section 3. Evaluation of Historical Importance

CHAPTER III. ARCHITECTURAL DATA
Section 1. Historical and Structural Design Including Comparison with Similar Buildings
Section 2. Existing Conditions and Architectural Description of the Fabric
Section 3. Additional Work Needed to Accomplish Architectural Research
Section 4. Recommendations
CHAPTER I

ADMINISTRATIVE DATA

Prepared by Superintendent M. O. Anderson
NAME AND NUMBER OF BUILDING:

McIlvaine House, 315-317 Walnut Street, Building No. 15.
PROPOSED USE OF STRUCTURES
AND JUSTIFICATION:

Contrary to our recommendations contained in the Administrative Data Section, Part I of Historic Structure Report submitted with that report on April 23, 1958, approved by the Regional Director May 2, 1958, with reservations concerning use of the building, and pending WASO approval, that this building be used to house an Architectural Exhibit, we now recommend that it be retained, and the interior adapted to serve in conjunction with the adjoining Yoh building as the permanent Park office. Our original recommendation was based on the assumption that the Park office would be established elsewhere and that the McIlvaine House could be satisfactorily utilized to house an architectural exhibit. Such an exhibit, however, can be housed elsewhere. Our recommendation as contained in the original submission, consequently, is hereby rescinded.
PROPOSED USE OF STRUCTURES AND JUSTIFICATION:

Branch Museum with exhibits illustrating architectural history in the Park, and to house architectural study collection. It is proposed to keep the Mallvaine House, built in the 1790's, as a landscape element in order to help maintain the original characteristics of the street front between Third and Fourth Streets. Both the Dilworth-Todd-Hoylan House and Bishop White House, which will be preserved and restored as historic house museums, were row houses. They can be appreciated best as part of a row. Standing alone with no buildings between them, indeed, they would look incongruous.

This building has been approved for rehabilitation in the Mission 66 and Master Plan for the Park.
PROVISION FOR OPERATING THE HOUSE:

Park Staff.
The house is proposed to be operated by the Park staff. No funds have yet been programmed for setting up the branch museum, and no cooperative agreements have as yet been effected or proposed for the purpose.
PRELIMINARY ESTIMATE OF COST FOR REHABILITATING THE STRUCTURE AND GROUNDS:

$64,600.
CHAPTER II
HISTORICAL DATA

Prepared by Martin I. Yoelson
STRUCTURAL EVIDENCE FROM DOCUMENTARY SOURCES

The McIlvaine House (see Illustration No. 2), 315-317 Walnut Street, is located on the north side of Walnut Street between South Third and Fourth Streets. It is on a lot fronting 24 feet 9 inches on Walnut Street and extending in depth 120 feet to Harmony Court. Erected between 1791 and 1793, this three-story brick building is a typical Philadelphia row house of the late eighteenth century.

The earliest description of this building is a 1793 fire insurance survey of the Mutual Assurance Company, which depicts it as:

From 1793 and until the Mutual Assurance policy was cancelled in 1826 no resurvey of the McIlvaine House was made. The absence of a resurvey indicates that during these early years few, if any, alterations were carried out which changed the interior or exterior appearance of the main building.

In 1845 the owner purchased a new policy from the Philadelphia Contributionship. The survey made in connection with this policy shows that the McIlvaine House and the adjacent building to the west (No. 319-321, a building erected after 1810) had been joined by a passageway constructed some years earlier. The survey (No. 6119) describes the combined structures (the McIlvaine House being the property to the east) thusly:

"I have surveyed a House (formerly two houses) belonging to William B. Fling, Situate on the North side of Walnut Street between Third & Fourth Streets No. 93 1/2, 95, 97 Being 45 feet front. 45 feet deep - three Stories high, 14 & 9 in walls. - The lower story is divided into a wide passage, running through - two rooms on the west side, & four rooms on the east side. the floor of the latter is 5/4" yellow pine, moulded base round, single mouldings to the doors & windows, two fire proof closets - two doors in front, each opening into a box entry or vestibule, the inner doors have each two lights of glass in the upper panel - two pair of folding doors dividing the rooms north & South - there being two offices separated by a plastered partition - the glass in front are 12 by 21 inch[ches] with panneled inside shutters. Glass back 13 by 20 inch[ches] with outside shutters. - On the west side of the passage are two rooms - the floor of clear, narrow yellow pine, moulded base round, single mouldings - folding door
between them, & a fire proof closet - Glass 12 by
20 in[chas] inside shutters front & outside do.
back. - The 2d Story is divided into five rooms &
passage. the floor, partly of clear yellow pine,
& partly of clear white pine. moulded base round,
double architraves & single mouldings on the East
side of the passage - & single mouldings on the west
side. - two pair of folding doors. & two fire proof
closets in this Story - Glass in front of the Eastern
part 14 by 20 in[ches] panneld inside Shutters. Glass
back 9 by 11 in[ches] outside Shutters. & in front
& back of the western part 12 by 20 in[ches] outside
Shutters to both, the front venetians in each - All
the sash are double hung. - The 3d Story in Six rooms
& passages, the floor in the Eastern part. of Comm[on]
yellow pine - & in the Western white pine. - plain
base, single Architraves Mouldings - three breast closets.
-Glass in front 10 by 13 in[ches] back 9 by 11 & 11 by
13 in[ches] - The Garret in four rooms, all plastered,
plain base, Single Architrave & Mouldings - three Cir-
cular dormer windows front. & two plain do. back. Glass
11 by 13 & 8 by 10 in[ches]. Straight Stairs with
turn'd ballusters & mahogany rail. leading from the
lower passage to the 2d Story. & an open newel Stairs
with plain String (?) & ballusters, poplar rail. painted,
from the 2d to the garret. In the cellar are two rooms
divided by a Stone wall, the floors of Comm[on] 5/4
in[ch] yellow pine, plain base & Single mouldings, two
sash doors front Glass 4 & 10 by 20 in[ches] Sliders to
ea. - Glass back on the Area. 8 by 10 in[ches] Outside
Shutters. - This building is divided by a brick wall
running North & South from the lower floor to the roof
- Modillion Eave front & plain Cornice back of the
Eastern part, & brick Eave front & back to the Western
part. tin gutter & pipes to both. The rooms in the
lower & 2d stories are papered ——

Between 1793 and 1845 a number of other buildings were
erected behind the main structure. They are described in the survey
as follows:

"...A Building in the rear, on the East Side of
an Avenue leading through to Harmony Court - Being 23
feet front 16 feet deep & Stair way 3 feet by 10 feet
two Stories high. And one on the West Side of 5d
Avenue 39 feet front 13 1/2 feet deep two Stories high
in[ch] walls - a privy on the North End of the first mentioned 8 feet by 14 feet - one Story high 4 1/2 in[ch] walls The first mentioned has two rooms in the lower Story, the floor of Comm[on] yellow pine, plain base round, single mouldings, Glass 11 by 17 in[ch] outside Shutters - Straight Stairs from the yard to the 2d Story which is in one room the floor of Comm[on] yellow pine, plain base & Single mouldings, Glass 8 by 10 in[ch] Venetian Shutters. - brick eave, shed roof, trap door, tin gutters & pipes. - Building on the West Side, the lower Story in three rooms. the Floor 5/4 in[ch] comm[on] yellow pine, plain base, single mouldings. Glass 12 by 16 in[ch] outside Shutters. the 2d Story in two rooms floor same - plain base, beads to windows, one closet - Glass 10 by 12 in[ch] - Straight Stairs at South End leading to the 2d Story. - The cellar is divided into rough coal boxes. & a passage on one side to Harmony Court. - Brick Eave, shed roof tin gutter & pipe. -

Ditto 20th 1845 John C. Evans
Surveyor

The lower & 2d Stories of the offices on both sides of the Avenue are papered.

Policy No. 6119. Drs 7000 at 2 1/2 per cent Drs 175- of the whole acct insured - it is declared and agreed that the Present building on it [lot] about Street is separately insured in the sum of Drs 5500 the Building on the East Side of the Avenue including the Privies for the sum Drs 700 [total] Drs 7000

It is agreed that the foregoing Statement and Survey are correct

Wm. B. Fling" (See Illustration No. 1 for view of McIlvaine House in 1845).

In 1848 the Contributionship made a survey (No. 7509) of those buildings in the rear of the McIlvaine House and 319-321 Walnut Street which faced Harmony Court. Although the date of
erection for these structures has yet to be determined, in the writer's opinion it took place during the second quarter of the nineteenth-century. The survey describes the structures as:

"...Two Adjoining brick Houses occupied & used as one belonging to William B. Fling situate on the south side of Harmony Court nearly opposite Whalebone Alley - One of them being 24 1/2 feet front by 26 feet deep three Stories high, a Privy 3 feet by 4 feet - two Stories High and the other 20 feet front (including an alley 6 feet wide) by 18 feet deep - three Stories high - 14 & 9 in. walls. - The lower story of the first is in one room, floor of rough Sap pine, groved & laid rough plain base & Single mouldings. - Glass 9 by 12 in. - outside Shutters. The 2nd Story is in one room, floor of wrough Sap pine, not plastered. The 3rd Story & Garret each in one room - the floor all the same, not plastered, two plain flat skylights in the roof. - rough, Straight Stairs from the front door to the 2nd Story & the same kind on the West Side from the 2nd Story to the Garret. - the 1 floor, oak joist, the upper of hemlock with a girder under each floor, with a rough post in the middle. - The lower Story of the adjoining house is in one room, floor of Sap pine, plain base, & beads to the windows, room plastered & papered. - the upper stories are not plastered, the floors are the same, as above mentioned. Glass 9 by 12 in & 8 by 10 in outside Shutters to the lower Story. - Shed roof on each, brick Eaves. tin Gutters & pipes. - doors of Communication with each other in the 2nd & 3d Stories. & a door in the Cellar of the Western house into the building on the South.

9 mo. 7, 1846. John C. Evans, Surveyor

In 1854 the owner of the McIlvaine House and the adjacent building, 319-321 Walnut Street purchased an insurance policy from the Mutual Assurance Company. However, the Contributionship policy
was retained. This resulted in a new survey. The 1854 survey
describes the main buildings as well as the rear structures in
greater detail than the earlier survey. Included with the survey
is a plan of the buildings. In comparing the 1854 survey with the
earlier one, we find that except for the removal of the two-story
privy (described in 1848) and enlargement of the one-story privy
(described in 1845) no substantial changes were made to the McIlvaine
House and the other structures. (See "Appendix" for the 1854 survey
with attached plan.)

Two years later, in 1856, the easternmost of the two
buildings fronting Harmony Court was remodelled from a three-story
to a four-story structure. The "partition" walls on the second
and third floors between this building and its neighbor to the
west were removed so each floor contained one large room running
the combined space of the two buildings. (See "Appendix" for the
November 19 and 25, 1856 surveys.)

A resurvey of the property in 1874 by the Philadelphia
Contributionship indicates that the roofs of all the buildings in­
cluding the McIlvaine House had been re-roofed with tin.

In 1882 the McIlvaine House underwent additional alter­
ations. These, however, were confined to the first story. The
only major change was the conversion of the first floor from two
rooms into three rooms and a vestibule. (See "Appendix" for the
1882 survey.)
No evidence has been uncovered to indicate additional alterations to the McIlvaine House since 1882.

It is recommended that an architectural investigation be conducted to substantiate the historical or documentary evidence in this section of the report. The investigation should determine what portion of the building originally designated as the McIlvaine House is still standing. In addition, the back buildings should be studied to determine which, if any, of these structures date to the historic period. In the event that any one of the back buildings fit into this category, then the architectural investigation should continue to determine what portion is intact.

Investigation to date strongly suggests the absence of a structure on this site prior to 1791; also, that the building known today as the McIlvaine House is substantially the one erected by Dr. William McIlvaine sometime between 1791 and 1793.
Ownership of Property to 1805

The lot represented today as 315-317 Walnut Street (the McIlvaine House) was originally part of a larger lot. It was 49 1/2 feet wide on Walnut Street and 200 feet deep on the east side and 180 feet deep on the west side. This larger lot was granted in 1684 to Thomas Minschull by William Penn as an original patent.

In 1702 the property was purchased by William Hudson, a currier and tanner. He retained it until his death in 1762. Sometime before then he erected a mill house, loft, shed, and currier shop on the western half of this lot.

At his death his son, Samuel, received the western half of the lot with the aforementioned buildings. The newly established lot was 24 feet 9 inches fronting on Walnut Street and in depth ran northward about 180 feet. (The William Hudson will omitted the depth dimensions; therefore, the footage was approximated by the writer who based his calculation on earlier chain-of-title records.) The lot bequeathed to Samuel Hudson included the McIlvaine House site.

In 1790 Samuel Hudson sold the Walnut Street property to Tench Francis. Shortly thereafter, a 12 foot alley (at present the eastern part of Harmony Court) was opened up between Third and Fourth Streets, thereby decreasing the length of the lot (running north and
south) to 120 feet. This lot is the piece of ground today represented by 315-317 Walnut Street. On May 19, 1791 Francis sold it to Thomas Shoemaker, a house carpenter. However, there is no indication in the title record transferring the property that Shoemaker received the tanning and currier buildings. Nor are they referred to in later transactions. Available evidence tends to indicate that these structures were situated on the portion of the lot retained by Francis.

Thomas Shoemaker retained ownership of his newly acquired property for a relatively short time. In the fall of 1791 he sold it to William McIlvaine who owned it until 1805.

Upon acquiring the property McIlvaine proceeded to erect a three-story brick house. The structure was completed by 1793 for in that year McIlvaine occupied the premises. McIlvaine was apparently the first occupant since neither the city directories nor the Philadelphia City and County tax records prior to 1793 list an occupant for earlier years. Moreover, the tax records for 1791 and 1792 described the McIlvaine House as an "unfinished building."

Prior to the erection of this house by McIlvaine, the available evidence fails to indicate the existence of any dwelling house.
Tenants of the McIlvaine House

Dr. William McIlvaine, the first owner and occupant, resided here in 1793 while pursuing his career as a surgeon and general practitioner. During that year the city of Philadelphia, then the capital of the United States, was scourged by an epidemic of yellow fever. The epidemic raged with such uncommon violence that over 5,000 inhabitants died. Moreover, the operations of the federal, state, and city governments and the trade of this municipality were disrupted. Although the citizens by the thousands retired to neighboring areas, McIlvaine remained and joined forces with other members of his profession to render medical services to the inflicted. Soon too, he was succumbed to with the fever, but fortunately recuperated. He was one of the few doctors to survive the epidemic. When the disorder ceased to rage and the city returned to normal, McIlvaine removed from Philadelphia to Burlington, New Jersey, where he continued to practice medicine until his death in 1806.

Biographical material concerning William McIlvaine is limited. He was born in Philadelphia in 1750 and received his early schooling in this city. At the age of sixteen he was sent to Scotland to perfect his education and received his medical degree at the University of Edinburgh. He returned to the colonies about 1773 settling in Bristol, Pennsylvania, where he began his practice. In the same year he married his first wife, Margaret Rodman, who
died in 1781. He then married Rebecca Coxe who died two years later. On June 16, 1785 he married Mary Shippen, daughter of Chief Justice Edward Shippen of Pennsylvania. Shortly thereafter, he moved to Philadelphia.

Little is known concerning McIlvaine's activities during the American Revolution other than his espousing the patriot cause and his serving in 1776 on attachment to Colonel Read's Regiment as a Surgeon.

McIlvaine resided at 315-317 Walnut Street, for about a year. As early as October, 1793, he had prospects of selling or renting the dwelling. His attempt to interest his neighbor, Dr. Benjamin Rush, in such a transaction failed. Some months later he leased it to Jasper Moylan.

Jasper Moylan, an attorney-at-law, resided here from 1794 to 1799. It was during this period that his step-brother, Stephen Moylan, who was Quarter-Master General for a time during the American Revolution, occupied the premises of the Dilworth-Todd-Moylan house located nearby at the northeast corner of Fourth and Walnut Streets.

Information concerning the life of Jasper Moylan as with Dr. McIlvaine is quite limited. Moylan was born in Ireland in 1758. In the 1770's he emigrated to Spain to gain employment with his uncles, then engaged in business. In 1781 he left Spain for
America. On October 1, 1791 he "took the Oath of Allegiance to Pennsylvania...as a...student of law." One year later he was admitted to the Philadelphia Bar, permitting him to practise law in the courts of the City and County of Philadelphia. Moylan's activities in this field were continued until his death in 1812. Other available information indicates that he was an ensign attached to the Philadelphia Associates of the Pennsylvania Militia and also a member of the Friendly Sons of St. Patrick.

In 1800 Daniel William Cox (Coxe), a merchant, tenanted the McIlvaine House and during the following two years the dwelling was occupied by a William Parkinson. In 1803 the property was leased by Charles Willing Hare, councillor-at-law. Two years later he purchased the house and lot from Dr. McIlvaine. Hare lived there until 1818 at which time he sold the property to James M. Brown. During this period although Hare was active in the courts of Philadelphia, having been admitted to the Bar in 1799, he was primarily engaged in the field of higher education as Professor of Law at the University of Pennsylvania.

Ownership since 1805

During Hare's ownership of the McIlvaine house, (1805-1818), he purchased the adjacent property, represented today as 319-321 Walnut Street, and proceeded to erect a three-story brick house on it. In 1818 he sold both properties to James M. Brown. Brown occupied
the premises for several years. In 1826 he sold the two properties to William B. Fling.

Fling resided there from 1828 to about 1855. Here in the earlier years he conducted a cabinet maker's business in part of the building and lived in the upper floors. By 1840 as indicated in the city directories Fling readjusted both his business and residential status. No longer in the cabinet making business but engaged in real estate, he retained his offices in the McIlvaine House and moved to a residence on Broad Street. Available evidence tends to indicate that it was Fling during this period who constructed the passageway between the McIlvaine House and 319-321 Walnut Street. (See the 1845 survey in Section 1, Chapter II.)

For about thirty years Fling continued to employ the McIlvaine House for offices and leased office space to others in varied businesses. Fling retained ownership until his death in 1873. The property was bequeathed to his sons who resold it in 1881 to Henry L. Gaw, Jr., a broker. His descendants owned it until 1945. Five years later the Federal Government purchased it as part of the Independence National Historical Park Project.
EVALUATION OF HISTORICAL IMPORTANCE

The historical importance of the McIlvaine House, other than its value as a part of the landscape setting, rests in part upon its association with Dr. William McIlvaine.

Dr. McIlvaine, who was responsible for the construction of this building and the first occupant, was not involved in the story of Independence nor with the formation of the government of the United States. However, in McIlvaine we have an example of the ordinary citizen of his day. He lived and worked in an area which was then not only the center of urban activity but the capital of the United States. He was within a short walking distance of Independence Square. Here were located the operations of the federal, state, and city governments. In 1793 the normal functioning of these governments was disrupted by a most severe epidemic of yellow fever. The urgent need of medical services at that time resulted in McIlvaine's participation by rendering assistance during the epidemic. His activities in connection with this disorder, although of slight significance, associate him with the Federal Period of the Park story.

Because of this association with Dr. William McIlvaine, the McIlvaine House has historical interest; but it is not of outstanding historical importance.
Of greater significance is the house itself. Because it was built during the historic period which the Park commemorates (1774-1800) and is one of the few existing eighteenth-century structures in the area alone, is evidence to denote its historical importance. Thus, the preservation of the McLlvaine House is considered historically desirable.
Survey of William E. Flings Two & Three Story Brick Buildings
Situate on the North side of Walnut Street between Third and Fourth streets; and extending through to Harmony Court for Dimensions of each see small plan [below].

No. 1 - Is the Eastern 3 Story Brick house on Walnut Street [the McIlvaine House]. Nos. 93 & 93 1/2

First Story. In 2 Rooms. As offices, wash boards & windows cases. Stucco cornice. 2 windows front 16 lights each. Glass 12 x 18. Inside shutters 2 windows back 12 lights. each Glass 13 x 20. panneled shutters outside [and] panneled sash door with slide 4 lights 10 x 17. with 4 light Transom. [manuscript torn] Glass 13 x 17. three round Iron bars outside. one pair of folding doors. to each room. one neat square head front door to each. One inside vestibule door 2 lights Glass 12 1/2 x 16. one brick fireproof. Iron doors. Marble head and sills. Yellow pine floor in this story both offices finished alike.


Third Story in 2 Rooms, closets, wash boards, & windows cased. 3 Windows front 16 Lights each. Glass 10 x 13 1/2. plain inside Shutters 3 do back 16 Lights each glass 9 x 11 -- inside shutters as front. Yellow pine floor. one fire proof as below. occupied as printing office.

Garrett in 3 Rooms, wash boards & Windows cases. 2 Circular head Double pitched Dormar Windows 12 Square lights each Glass 10 x 13 1/2 and 6 fancy shaped do in each. one square head double pitched do back 16 lights. 8 x 10. [?] work inside and out. Wood cornice front and back. Shingle Roof. Tin Gutters and Iron Conductors built [built] in Wall.

No. 2 To the Western 3 story brick house, on Walnut Street Nos. 95 1/2 & 97. including the passage leading through into the Yard. front 19 x 9 Depth 45 feet.

SECOND STORY. in 2 rooms, yellow pine floor, washboards & Windows cased. Two Windows front 12 lights each. Glass 12 by 20. Venetian shutters. outside 2 do back 12 lights each. Glass 12 by 20. Inside shutters. one pair large folding doors. One brick fire proof, as below. one 6 and one 4 light Transom over doors to Entry doors & windows finished around with 3 Inch Moulding. one Marble Top wash basin sides lined with Marble. Urinal and Water Closet. one flight Mahogany ramp hand rail stairs. square ballusters to Third Story in [manuscript torn] part close boarded. door on landing.

THIRD STORY, in 3 Rooms one brick fire proof as below closets. washboards and windows cased. 4 [manuscript torn] 12 lights. each Glass 12 x 13. white pine floor. One water closet &c one light [manuscript torn]

GARRET, in one. wash boards & Windows cased. 2 Dormar windows [manuscript torn] each Glass 8 x 10. white pine floor. Brick cornice front & back Shingles in [side - manuscript torn] Sky light in roof to light stairs. Glass 18 x 30. heavy. Tin Gutters & Conductors.

BASEMENT. STORY, under the 2 building. occupied as a Liquor Store. yellow pine floor, all plastered, one window front 16 lights. Glass 10 x 16, inside shutters 3 pair folding sash doors front with slides, with 6 lights Glass 11 x 16, and 12 small do 3 1/2 x 18 in each pair. 3 wood steps inside do each. 2 large square cased posts to support floor above. one 18 light & one 12 light window back. Glass 9 x 11 panneled shutters outside. 2 doors leading to Area. 3 large closets under fire proofs.

Back at the distance of 7 feet. is no. 3. - a 2 story-Brick Building [next word illegible]

FIRST STORY in two Rooms as Offices. wash boards & Windows cased. 3 Windows 12 lights each. Glass 11 x 17. panneled shutters outside. 3 square head front doors, 3 light Transom over each yellow pine floor. One flight close stairs leading to second Story. one window with inside shutters

Second Story. in one room finished as below. one Window 12 lights Glass 11 x 17. inside shutters. 2 do. 20 lights each 9 x 11. Brick cornice. Shingle Roof. Tin Gutters & Conductor. Back of this building is 11 privies, seats, lids, & Risers. No. 4. Back of Western building No. 2, at the distance of 7 feet is No. 5 a Two Story brick building 13 feet 9 inches by 39 feet.
FIRST STORY, in 3 Rooms, as offices, wash boards & windows cased. Yellow pine floor. 3 windows 12 lights each. Glass 12 x 16. Panneled shutters outside. 4 square head door with 3 light Transom over each, one pair of folding doors. one flight straight stairs to second Story.

SECOND STORY in Room. finished as below. 4 windows. 12 lights each. Glass 11 x 14. brick cornice. Tin gutter & Conductor.

No. 6 is a three story brick building fronting on Harmony Court and directly in rear of No. 1, 3 & 4 - First Story in 2 Rooms, wash boards, and windows cased. 2 windows front 12 lights each. Glass 13 x 20. Panneled shutters outside. 2 do 12 lights each. Glass 12 x 16 1/2 Inside shutters. Marble Top wash Stands &c. One square head side door. one square head front sash door with slide. 9 lights Glass 9 1/2 x 13 1/2. one flight straight & winding partly close stairs to second Story. Second Story, in 2 Rooms by brick Wall. (Note of these rooms, is the second Story of the building No. 7 which will be described hereafter) and communicated by doorway in brick wall. walls not plastered. ceilings only between Joice. yellow pine floor. one rough Girder extending across No. 6. one square post under, one flight close straight & winding stairs to Third story. 180 lights. Glass 8 1/2 x 12. door at bottom of stairs. Stereotype Foundry. Third Story in 2 Rooms as below not plastered one girder as below 178 lights of Glass 9 x 11. one flight of close stairs to Garrett of No. 6. floor as below in the 3d Story of No. 6 is a large Melting pan & Oven. built around with brick. brick hearth appears safe. the ceiling of this story of No. 7 is formed by the roof. not plastered. covered with cedar shingles. Tin Gutter & Conductor occupied as Stereotype Foundry. Garrett of No. 6 in one, not plastered yellow pine floor. 3 Windows 12 lights each. Glass 8 x 10. one 8 light sky light in Roof. Glass 8 x 10. broken pitched Shed roof. covered with Cedar shingles. one small Girder as below. Tin Gutter & Conductor. brick cornice & blind Screens for the back windows of No. 6 to 2nd & 3d Stories & Garrett.

No. 7 (a three story brick building fronting on Harmony Court and directly in rear of Nos. 2 & 5. front 19 x 9 including a 6 feet passage depth 17 x 9.

FIRST STORY in one room, as office. wash boards. & windows cased. yellow pine floor. 3 windows front 18 lights each. Glass 9 x 11. Panneled shutters outside, one square head side door, one communicating do to one room of the 2 Story Building. The other other [sic] stories of this building is described in connection with the stories of No. 6. One large sloat [or stoa] Gate to passage Not. the shingles on Roof of No. 7 is covered with Tin, Gutters & Conductor same.
$5,500 Insured on the Main Building in the Contributionship Co.

800 " " Buildings on West side of Avenue

700 " Do East side of Avenue

2,000 " Do Harmony Court - & in

Case of Loss to be [illegible] Inspectionably by with Each

Co., equally to the above statements

Geo C. Justus

for Philip Justus
HARMONY COURT 25 x 0

No. 6
3 Sty Building
25x0 by 27x4

No. 7
3 Sty Building
13x9 by 17x9

No. 5
2 Sty Building
13x9 by 39x0

No. 4
11 privies

No. 3
2 Sty Building
16. x 23.0

No. 2 West
3 Sty Building
19x9 by 45x0

No. 1 East
3 Sty Building
25x3 by 45x0

[319-321 Walnut St.]

Stairs to Yard

Passage to Yard

Passage to Street

Yards

Area

Area

16 x 0

7 x 0

7 x 0

45 x 0

25 x 3

19 x 9

Walnut Street

Sketch of W.B. Flings Buildings
In viewing the within described premises & find that the partitions in all the Stories above the first Story removed between No. 6 & the Rooms over the passage the front wall of Garrett of No. 6 raised one Story the roof of new single pitched and covered with Tin. 4 Windows front & end 12 lights each 9 x 11. All other parts remain as before described

Novr 19/56

George C. Justus
Surveyor
I have Resurvey the Within described Building and find the following alterations and additions made, viz: The Eastern part 24 1/2 feet by 26 feet has been raised to 4 Stories high and has three 12 light windows 9 x [manuscript torn] inches, and a 9 light sash door, with a plain Hoisting Piece out over it, Trap doors in the roof. The Stairs have been continued up from the second story to the 4th Story in this part of the Building, and the stairs in the other part taken out. The wall between the two Buildings has been taken out in the 2nd and 3rd Stories, and both rooms thrown into one in those stories, and the whole covered with tin.

November 25, 1856.   D. R. Knight
Surveyor

Note. The Furnace for melting lead has been removed from the 3rd Story to the Fourth story.

Wm. B. Fling
I have resurveyed the annexed described premises and find the following Alterations and Additions in Nos. 315 and 317 [McIlvaine House] Viz

First Story East of Passage divided into 3 Rooms, and Vestibule Mahogany base, Moulded, Vestibule in front 5 feet 3 inches, wide, by 4 feet 3 inches deep. One pair of 2 light 15 by 42 in folding Vestibule doors, with single lights transom. One each close hinged and sliding walnut doors, one iron door of wrought iron flat bars, about 5 feet high. Paneled wainscoat about 46 inches high in one room. Two 2 lights 48 by 42 inch and one 47 x 42 inches windows; close shutters to one window, and job on see [?] and paneled shutters to the others, all in 6 folds and 2 lengths inside - a bulk head under 2 windows - One wooden bracket mantel with bracket to floor; one ditto with brackets in 2 parts with a turned column between the lengths - One ditto with short brackets; three raised Goates, Enclosed wash basin with countersunk top and 10 inch Skirting, and one plated cock. 4 inch Architraves, Walls and ceilings painted - All woodwork above described of hard wood (Walnut or Mahogany) -

9 No 12 1882

I Louis Moore Surveyor

Agreed to be correct
The McIlvaine House, c. 1845-1850, Kennedy Collection, Historical Society of Pennsylvania.
Illustration No. 2

CHAPTER XIII

ARCHITECTURAL DATA

Prepared by Resident Architect C. S. Grossman
HISTORICAL AND STRUCTURAL DESIGN
INCLUDING COMPARISON WITH SIMILAR BUILDINGS

The Hallvaine House was built sometime between 1791 and April 13, 1793, the date of the first survey by the Mutual Assurance Company.

In size and plan the house is similar to the Bishop White House and was typical of the larger row houses of the period. It was constructed on a narrow, deep lot, the lot being 24 feet 9 inches wide and 120 feet deep.

In plan and function the house was divided into three units, the front house or family quarters, the piazza or stair hall, and the kitchen wing with a one-story building in the rear. Since only superficial archeological and architectural investigations have been made it is not known at this time whether evidence of a necessary or other minor structure exists (See Plates Nos. 1 to 6).

Front House

The front house occupied the full width of the lot and extended 40 feet 6 inches in depth. It was 3 stories to the cornice with a garret under the gabled roof. The distinguishing features of the facade were brick band courses at the second, third and attic floor levels (See Plates No. 9 & 10). In the Mutual Assurance Company survey of April 13, 1793, we find the following description of the dormers and cornice "Two Arched Dormers in front---Courses 5 1/2 inches---Modillion
Eaves, --Frontispiece not put up.--" (See Plates No. 6, 9, & 16). From the same source we have the description of the interior of the front house: "Lower Story Dovelled 1 1/4 Floors—plastered between Joists Base & Surfase with Mantles. Windows Cased with Flat panels, two set of Marble Jams & Slabs & Stucco Cornice. Second Story Narrow Floors inside Shutters, Mantles Surfase washboards, and two set Marble Slabs. and Jams, Stucco Cornice. Third Story, Mantles Closet Frames washboards Surfase and inside Shutters. Garret's plastered. Trap door."

Each floor contained 2 rooms and a hallway except the attic which was divided into 3 rooms. The cellar foundations indicate that on the first floor the hallway extended along the east wall from the front door to the piazza. No evidence exists as to the extent of the hallway on the upper floors.

**Piazza**

Mutual Assurance Company survey of April 13, 1793, described the stairway as follows: "Piazza 10 feet by 10 feet & two stories high, two flights of open newel stairs Sape with Mahogany handrails & posts--"

**Kitchen and Rear Building**

The same source describes the kitchen as follows: "Kitchen 15.6 by 23 feet. & 2 Stories high. Lower Story Closet Mantle Bar-
base. Washboards & windows Cased. --- Chamber Mantle, washboards Cased. Building in the rear 11 by 22 feet --- one story high & plain.
--- Glass 10 by 10"
EXISTING CONDITIONS AND
ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION OF THE FABRIC

The Hellvaine House shows the effect of time and a changing neighborhood by the extensive changes which have been made in its fabrics over the years.

Plates No. 1 to 8 and 11 to 16 record the existing condition of the house and the important structural changes which have been made.

Since it is proposed not to restore the interior of the house to its historic appearance but to replace the existing unstable interior walls, etc., with some type of rigid frame construction, the architectural description of the fabric of the building will be confined to the exterior of the building.

Walnut Street Facade

The Walnut Street facade is original except for the first floor wall, the window sash and portions of the cornice (See Plates No. 6 & 9). The wall shows a perceptible bulge outward. This apparent structural weakness will require study to determine methods of correcting this condition since the roof construction and approximately half of the floor load of the attic are supported on this wall and the rear wall of the front house.

Party Wall

The east and west party walls are 9 inches thick and support the entire floor loads at the second and third floors and approximately
half of the attic floor load. The west party wall has been weakened by a number of openings in the wall, especially on the third floor where approximately a third of the wall has been removed.

**Rear Wall of the Front House**

The rear wall has been removed at the first floor and the upper wall carried on steel beams (See Plates No. 2 & 10). A large skylight replaces the roof dormers and none of the window sashes are original (See Plates No. 4, 5, 6, & 10). Evidence indicated that the east window on the second floor originally was a doorway from the piazza to the second floor bedrooms (See Plate No. 6). All other work including the brick cornice appears to be original.

**Piazza or Stair Hall**

Nothing remains of the piazza except a portion of the east party wall.

**Kitchen**

The south wall has been removed (See Plates No. 2 & 3). The original west, north and east party walls remain but have received several alterations consisting chiefly of adding or relocating window openings (See Plates No. 2, 3 & 7).
ADDITIONAL WORK NEEDED TO ACCOMPLISH
ARCHITECTURAL RESEARCH

Research has been accomplished to the extent of recording
the existing condition of the building with measured drawings.

Completion of the architectural research will require a
careful examination of the external fabrics of the building, recording
all original evidence, a study of all available documents related to
the building, a study of existing similar buildings to secure authentic
information concerning the missing parts. An evaluation of all evi­
dence and the preparation of drawings for the restoration of those
portions of the building to be retained or reconstructed.

An archeological investigation will also be required.
It will be ascertained from an analysis of Section 2 of Chapter III of this report, that the most pressing problem involved in the preservation of the McIlvaine House is the structural stabilization of the building.

It will also be noted that because of the extensive alterations over the years including the removal of portions of the exterior walls on the first floor and interior crosswall, the removing of the adjacent Yoh Building to the east would have an adverse effect on the stability of the McIlvaine House. The Bishop White House which abuts the Yoh Building on the east and which is programmed for restoration as a historic house museum would also be adversely affected by the removal of the Yoh Building. Plate No. 17 shows the existing relationship of these buildings to each other. The fenestration on the lower three floors align horizontally and the floor elevations are approximately the same.

It is not proposed to restore the interior of the McIlvaine House. The Park museum prospectus proposes that the house be used as an architectural museum. The fact that it is proposed not to restore the interior suggests that stabilization of the exterior fabric would be assured by replacing the present interior construction with rigid frame fireproof construction to which the exterior walls could be
firmly secured. This method might make it possible to remove the Yoh Building after the rigid frame had been constructed and the walls secured. However, since the Bishop White House is to be restored as a historic house museum the introduction of rigid frame construction in this building would have an adverse effect on the authenticity of its restoration and value as a historic building.

Historically both the McIlvaine House and the Bishop White House were row houses and the site of the present Yoh Building was occupied by two more row houses. To insure the continued stability of the McIlvaine and Bishop White Houses as well as to provide the architectural and historic setting of these houses as units in a row of houses, it is suggested that the Yoh Building, which is constructed of reinforced concrete, be demolished to the third floor level and that the existing front be removed and replaced by a period facade (See Plate No. 13). As noted in the historic building survey report on the Bishop White House, it is considered essential that a means be provided of tying and securing the existing fabric of the Bishop White House. Retention of a portion of the reinforced concrete of the Yoh Building would provide a means of tying and stabilizing these walls.

It is proposed to restore only the exterior of the McIlvaine House to the historic period. The interior rehabilitation of the
building would be such as to permit the use of the building for non-historic functions. It is considered possible to place the new floor levels of the McIlvaine House at the same level as those of the Yoh Building. This would permit the maximum flexibility in their use. The buildings could be occupied by two separate organizations, or, by means of openings between the two buildings, by a single organization requiring more floor space.

In the event the Yoh Building is retained as described above, the rear of the building would have to be modified to conform to the architecture of the historic period. Historically, both the Bishop White and the McIlvaine Houses were Philadelphia row house units. Plate No. 18 shows them restored in such a setting. In our historic period, not all lots along Walnut Street were occupied by buildings. Therefore, the vacant lots adjacent to the Bishop White and McIlvaine Houses would conform to that period.

It is recommended that:

1. The exterior of the McIlvaine House be restored to the historical period and that the interior be reconstructed, using rigid frame, fireproof construction.

2. A portion of the Yoh Building be retained to provide structural stability for the adjoining Bishop White and McIlvaine Houses.
3. That a new facade and roof be designed for the Walnut Street portion of the Yah building and that the rear of the building be modified as necessary so as to be in harmony and character with the period and the adjacent buildings.
LONGITUDINAL SECTION A-A 15'-0"

McILVAIN HOUSE
Hull's House
Front (South Elevation)
Rear (North) Elevation
Note skylight
First floor looking south. Note that all interior partitions have been removed.
Second floor north room.
Third floor looking south.
Third floor looking north showing skylight and garret floor removed.
Southeast room of Garret looking south.
SCHEME for RETAINING the LOWER PORTION of the YOH BUILDING for the PURPOSE of STABILIZING the M'ILVAINE HOUSE and the BISHOP WHITE HOUSE.