

Des 14

Resources Management Plan

Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site

(1987 Revision)

NPS-12 *categorically excluded*

Recommended:

Superintendent

Date

Approved:

Regional Director

Date

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Management Objectives	3

Part I

Cultural Resource Management Program

Overview and Needs	4
Management Actions by Priorities	9

Cultural Resource Project Statements:

Management of Museum Collections (C-05)	11
Historic Scene Study/Restoration Plan (C-13)	15
Rehab Flooring, Trading Post (C-16)	16
Stabilize Hogan (C-17)	21
Historic Structures Reports (C-09)	20
Carrying Capacity Study (C-12)	25

Preserve Archeological Sites (C-08).....	28
Research Hubbell Business (C-06).....	32
Prepare Historic Furnishings Report (C-10).....	36
Prepare Administrative History (C-11).....	40
Ethnographic Overview (C-14).....	42
Archeological Assessment (C-15).....	45
Five-Year Programming Sheet.....	47

Part II

Natural Resources Management Program

Overview and Needs.....	48
Natural Resource Project Statements:	
Construct Boundary Fence.....	49
Five-Year Programming Sheet.....	51
Environmental Assessment.....	52
Bibliography.....	53

Part I

Cultural Resources Program

INTRODUCTION

The Resources Management Plan for Hubbell Trading Post is a key planning document describing constraints upon Park Management as well as outlining required research work projects needed to best maintain the historical character and integrity of this Site.

The RMP is an integral part of the General Management Plan and the Statement for Management. These plans dovetail together and identify the problem areas as they relate to the park's resources. The objectives stated in the Statement for Management are supported by identified research proposals and resource needs in the RMP.

Since the last revision of this document (01/23/83) a considerable headway has been made, both in terms of preservation and research. However, much remains to be done to provide for the long-term management and interpretation of the Site.

Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site is a primary cultural resource that is truly unique in the National Park System. No other park has an active, uncontrived living history presence as does the

trading post.

In the past RMP it was the opinion of management that all research and work proposals should compliment and enhance the trading post operation. Current management takes the position that even though the trading post is the center attraction, there was and is more to Hubbell Trading Post NHS. Management philosophy must embrace the entire spectrum of the original Hubbell operation as well as historical, natural, and archeological resources, ethnology, and interpretation.

The Site is governed by several legislative mandates that influence management and operations:

1. The Antiquities Act of 1906
2. The National Park Service Organic Act of 1916
3. The Historic Sites Act of 1935
4. The National Historic Preservation Act of 1966
5. The National Environmental Policy Act of 1969
6. Executive Order 11593, May 13, 1971
7. The Historical and Archeological Data Preservation Act of 1974

8. Public Law 89-148, August 28, 1965

9. Archeological Resources Protection Act PL 96-95

Management Objectives

1. Maintain the delicate balance between use and preservation of historic structures so that historic fabric is not unnecessarily altered, damaged, or destroyed.
2. Provide the most accurate and reliable information possible on which to base management decisions regarding the historic structures, the historic scene, and interpretation.
3. Provide the necessary storage, cataloging, and curatorial services for the Hubbell collection.
4. Ensure the protection of prehistoric and historic resources as well as developed facilities from erosion.
5. Reestablish the Hubbell farm.

PART I - CULTURAL RESOURCES

A. OVERVIEW AND NEEDS

Purpose of the Park

Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site was established by Public Law 80-148, August 28, 1965, to preserve the structures and lands associated with, and content of, and to perpetuate the operation of a "living" trading post that has been in continuous operation since its founding in 1876.

The purpose of the park is further delineated in the National Park Service Organic Act of 1916, as: "To conserve the scenery and the natural and historic objects and the wildlife therein and to provide for the enjoyment of the same in such manner and by such means as will leave them unimpaired for the enjoyment of future generations."

Data Base and Resource Problem Needs

The information base has been improved since the previous RMP was prepared, but more studies are needed. Formal studies are needed on the Hubbell family, their business and political activities, their impact on the reservation, and why their business survived for so long. Also needed are studies to support cross-cultural interpretation.

From a preservation standpoint, we still need historic structures reports on all of our buildings. These should address not only structural history, but use and occupancy as well. These will then serve a dual role by providing basic data for interpreters and preservationists.

The Barn (HB-3) is badly in need of a new roof. The reconstructed roof put on in the mid-1970s has greatly deteriorated. A re-roofing job has been funded through the Regional Cultural Resources program for FY 87, thus it is not included as a project in this document.

Accomplishments Since Last Revision

Several important projects have been accomplished since the RMP was last revised. The preservation of the sheds and corrals complex (HUTR-C-01), farm equipment stabilization (HUTR-C-02), and stabilization of Bunkhouse HB-5 (HUTR-C-03), and the farmlands study (HUTR-C-04) have all been completed. In addition, a computerized preservation guide has been prepared and implemented, which fills the requirements of HUTR-C-07. The area has received cyclic project funding for curatorial management of the Site's collections. Significant progress has been made in this area, but a great deal more work is needed to bring the collections, storage, and environmental conditions up to standard.

Other projects accomplished, but not included in the previous RMP, were stabilization of the Bread Oven and preservation/stabilization of the Corrals.

Overview and Needs

The emphasis for the next few years will be to further basic research in support of site management and interpretation. There is still much to be learned about the Hubbell business, political activities, and other interests. Such a study is vital to the interpretive development of the Site.

The Development Concept Plan calls for the restoration of the Hubbell farmlands, including the irrigation system. Management recognizes that visitors are not exposed to this important aspect of the post and that they need to be. However, it appears that budgets will be restricted for the foreseeable future and with that in mind, the objectives perceived in the DCP will have to be compromised somewhat. The restoration of all or most of the original farmlands is both impractical from a cost/maintenance standpoint and unnecessary for public understanding. Therefore, the approach to be taken will be a partial restoration of the land and irrigation system. Along with this, the grounds immediately surrounding the historic building complex must be considered. Together they comprize a significant aspect of the total historic

scene and they should convey a definite, if subtle, message to the visitor. .

To accomplish this, we need a study of the appearance of the land and grounds during the entire period of Hubbell occupancy. An historic scene restoration plan can then be developed, followed by implementation and long-term maintenance.

Considering that the area has had a relatively large number of superintendents during its twenty years of existence as an NPS unit, an administrative history remains an important need.

Some ethnographic research has already been done, but there is potential for a great deal more. Over the years the park staff has collected many personal interviews, both written and oral, that could be of great benefit in helping to define just what and how much influence the Hubbells had on the local populace. An ethnographic overview will be a logical first step in determining just what studies may be needed.

The Collection Management Plan is outdated and must be revised. It should specifically address the critical situation posed by the environmental conditions of the trading post building itself.

This plan also addresses two significant preservation problems: the condition of the floors in the Trading Post and stress cracks in

the Stone Hogan. These may involve major projects to correct the present conditions.

Since the area contains several archeological sites, these need a thorough, professional assessment. Once this is accomplished, management may want to consider requesting a complete Historic Resources Study, including a detailed base map.

Cultural Resources-Management Actions by Priorities

A. Critical Problems

C-05 Management of Museum Collections

C-13 Historic Scene Study/Restoration Plan

C-16 Replace Flooring in Trading Post

C-17 Stabilize Hogan, HB-6

B. Less Significant Problems

C-09 Historic Structures Reports

C-12 Carrying Capacity Study

C-08 Preservation of Archeological Resources

C. Data Base Information

C-06 History of Hubbell Business Operations

C-10 Furnishing Plans

C-11 Administrative History

C-14 Ethnographic Overview

C-15 Archeological Assessment

Project Statement Title: Management of Museum Collections

C-05

I. Statement of Problem

The collection at Hubbell Trading Post NHS consists of approximately 26,383 ethnographic, archeological, historic and fine arts objects. Continuous management is required to bring the collection up to established NPS standards and to maintain those standards. Additional environmentally controlled storage is also needed.

A. Background Information

The collection at Hubbell Trading Post is the largest and most valuable in the Southwest Region. Item are stored under varying conditions; in a relatively controlled storage room, in outbuildings, and out-of-doors. Items are on permanent exhibit in the Hubbell Home and the Trading Post. Both of these buildings are without environmental controls. Fluctuations in temperature and relative humidity are severe (during the winter Trading Post

temperatures range from 60 F to 90 F daily and RH can vary from 15% to 80% within one-half hour during summer thunderstorms.) Special project money has permitted contract conservation on many objects. However, if they are exhibited they are exposed to the same environment that caused deterioration originally.

Cataloging objects is time consuming. To date, 11,674 items have cataloged and 8,748 have been registered. Approximately 5,961 objects remain to be cataloged. With the full-time curator and a subject to furlough museum technician now comprising the staff, it will take six years to completely register the remaining backlog. At that point, there will be approximately 14,709 registered objects that will require the addition of catalog data. Because of the limited staff, progress in upgrading the care and maintenance of the collection is very slow. Much time is spent performing basic maintenance and management: housekeeping, periodic inspection of individual objects, inventory, loans, gifts, reports, administrative duties, monitoring environment, on-site conservation, and upgrading storage facilities. Little time remains for cataloging, documentation, and resources.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Action

Progress is being made in improving the storage of objects, housekeeping and maintenance, records, contract conservation, and

cataloging. We are maintaining a minimum response in caring for the Hubbell Collection, which means that we will lose historic fabric.

B. Continue Current Management Action

Continue minimum maintenance and care of the collection. This will result in the possible loss of historic material/fabric resources that are non-renewable. No complete accountability of the collection will be feasible.

C. Bring Collection Up to NPS Standards -- Recommended Action

To bring the entire collection up to NPS standards and to maintain it professionally, more funds and person-hours are required and the following need to be included in the management:

1. Update Collections Management Plan (1975).
2. Prepare study of environmental conditions in Trading Post and develop methods to correct deficiencies.
3. Accession and catalog specimens to standard.
4. Exhibit items in a manner to minimize handling and deterioration.
5. Construct additional storage facility with environmental controls to provide optimum storage for entire collection.

6. Provide on-site or contract conservation services to maintain the items in satisfactory condition for their preservation and intended use.

7. Continue periodic inspection of individual objects and routine maintenance. Annually update the Maintenance Manual that outlines scheduled housekeeping; establish cyclic conservation.

8. Purchase IBM or IBM compatible computer and NPS cataloging program.

9. Photograph valuable objects in the collection, particularly items on exhibit that are vulnerable to theft.

I. Statement of Problem

Over the years the grounds surrounding Hubbell Trading Post have gone through many changes, as the result of both Hubbell family and NPS actions. The present condition . . . grounds do not reflect accurately any historical period. Visitors do not understand that Hubbell's operation . . . irrigated farming. Likewise, the appearance of the grounds immediately surrounding the buildings complex was much different historically than today.

A. Background Information

Hubbell Trading Post was established in ¹⁸⁷⁶1876 and has been in operation continually since that time. Consequently, it has seen many changes and developments. For many years farming was an important aspect of the Hubbell operation. This included an extensive irrigation system and fruit orchards. The area immediately surrounding the Hubbell Home was influenced by the various family members who resided there from 1902 until 1967. When

the post was acquired by the National Park Service, one of the intended purposes was that it continue to be operated as an active trading post in the Hubbell tradition. It was not to be "frozen in time" at any particular historical period.

During the past twenty years, however, management has taken inconsistent approaches to managing the historic scene by largely ignoring the fields adjacent to the complex, removing structures that were here in 1967, manipulating vegetation without proper research, greatly altering the appearance of the entrance road, and making other changes of greater or lesser impact. Without professional research into the documents and, particularly, the many historical photographs available, management actions will continue to lack direction and purpose. A determination needs to be made as to exactly what it is that we wish to convey to the visitor through the physical appearance of the post's environment. And, we need to develop a plan for achieving and maintaining whatever goal that is.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action (No Action)

No research is being done. No specific efforts are being made to alter or restore either the complex grounds or the fields.

If the current situation continues, degradation of the resource will occur in that nature will take its course to obliterate the irrigation ditches and re-establish vegetative cover on the fields. Without guidance, management actions will continue to alter the appearance of the Site to a greater or lesser degree. The cumulative effect of these actions will likely have a significant impact on the resource. Without a plan, we will have trouble justifying to the Navajo Tribe our claim for irrigation water.

B. Research and Prepare Historic Scene Management Plan

(Recommended)

Management now has in hand the Farmlands Study to use as a basic research document relating to agricultural development of the Hubbell lands. The Site collections also contain a wealth of historical photographs. These two sources, plus any others that may be of value, need to be utilized by a qualified researcher to develop a chronological overview of land use, vegetative types, zones, and densities as appropriate. This study should extend to the grounds immediately surrounding the buildings complex, including flower beds and yards.

This study should present alternatives and recommendations for the the long-term management of the historic scene, keeping in mind the realities of funding and manpower.

Project Statement Title: Rehab Flooring - Trading Post

C-16

I. Statement of Problem

The original flooring of the Trading Post (HB-1) is quite worn. It has been patched in numerous places with new wood or scabbed over with sheets of plywood. It is sagging in places and because of the many repairs over the years, it has various levels even within a given room. The present condition of the flooring presents problems both from a preservation standpoint and from a visitor/employee safety standpoint.

A. Background Information

The floor is constructed of random-width pine boards, most of which lie on joists that in turn rest directly on the ground. There is little or no ventilation space as blow-dirt has accumulated beneath the floor for a century. A recommendation to replace the flooring in this building was submitted as early as 1970 (Structure Report),

but has never been done. Through the years the floor has been repaired in many places, but is now getting in such bad shape from both human traffic and natural rotting that it requires a major rehab.

II. Alternatives and Possible Impacts

A. Current Management Action

Repairs to the floor are made as needed. Small patches are made with boards or plugs, while larger areas are covered with plywood. In some instances, even the plywood has been replaced. A carrying capacity study is being requested elsewhere in this document, but that will not benefit the existing floor as it is largely already worn out.

B. Rehab or Replace Flooring

This would remedy the problem and would allow for the accumulated dirt to be removed from the sub-floor area. However, it would destroy historic fabric.

C. Construct Superposed Floor (Recommended Action)

Construct a new floor of historically correct materials over the existing original floor. This would preserve the remaining original floor intact and would correct the deficiencies noted above.

Project Statement Title: Stabilize Hogan

C-17

I. Statement of Problem

The walls and floor of the Stone Hogan (HB-6) are showing signs of serious cracking. This may be caused by settling of the foundation or by the weight of the roof, or both.

A. Background Information

The Stone Hogan was constructed in the early 1930s. In the late 1970s, when problems similar to those described above occurred, a French drain was constructed around the building and the walls were mechanically pulled back together.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action

The Regional Historical Architect has been notified of this condition and his assistance requested. At the present time the situation is being monitored and data recorded. If corrective action is not taken, the condition will probably worsen and the historic building will be adversely impacted. At worst, the building could be weakened structurally and perhaps damaged.

B. Rehabilitate Hogan

Based upon data and findings produced by the current monitoring, develop and implement corrective action to preserve the historic structure as required by legislative mandates.

Project Statement Title: Historic Structures Reports

C-09

I. Statement of Problem

Immediately after the National Park Service acquired Hubbell Trading Post, historic structures reports were prepared for management of the buildings. The reports are incomplete and need detailed, current information on the structural histories of the buildings, as well as a history of use and occupancy.

A. Background Information

Although Historic Structures Reports have been completed for most of the buildings in the Hubbell Compound, these reports were prepared in the 1960s without the benefit of data that has become available subsequently through interviews with the Hubbell family and the organization of the Hubbell papers. Through the years, additional information about the structures has been gained through completed preservation work.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management

No research is being conducted on building use, occupancy, or structural changes. If further research is not undertaken, knowledge of these aspects will continue to be minimal. This information is needed for the future preservation of the structures, as well as interpretation.

B. Preparation of Historic Structures Reports

(Recommended Action)

Prepare a study encompassing the construction, use and occupancy, and structural history of each building, HB-1 through HB-13. This information will benefit public interpretation at the Site and will benefit both park maintenance and regional preservation crews in making decisions concerning preservation and cyclic maintenance activities. Likewise, it will provide management with a sound foundation for future decisions affecting the historic structures.

Project Statement Title: Carrying Capacity Study

C-12

Statement of Problem

There is an increasing impact on the primary resources, the Trading Post, and the Hubbell Home. Approximately 138,000 visitors pass through the Trading Post annually, while approximately 8,500 persons participate in guided tours of the Home. There are most certainly impacts on both of these historic structures, but the exact nature and long-term effects are unknown. Research is needed to make determinations as to the optimum, or at least maximum, numbers of visitors these resources can accommodate without incurring significant deterioration to the buildings.

A. Background Information

Both the Trading Post and the Hubbell Home have wooden floors. The Home had its original flooring laid down in 1902 and duplications of the original rugs adorn the floors throughout the home today. The Trading Post's floors have been repaired several times over the years and portions have been covered by plywood to minimize wear and to protect the historic fabric. Both buildings, HB-1 and 2,

contain valuable museum collections and the Trading Post has a merchandise inventory in excess of \$300,000.

The carrying capacity for fire safety for the Trading Post and wareroom is 74 people, but this may be too many people to maintain security for the collection and inventory. People travel to Hubbell's in a variety of vehicles, including buses. The mainstay of the business is the Navajo patrons. When all groups of people visit the Trading Post at the same time, conditions can be rather crowded. Tours through the Hubbell Home are limited to 15 persons. This number is sometimes difficult for the ranger to control because of the many rooms in the Home.

II. Alternatives and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action

No action beyond establishing a fire safety capacity of 74 on the Trading Post and an arbitrary limit of 15 persons per guided Home tour. Degradation of the resource may be occurring.

B. Develop Carrying Capacity Study for Trading Post and Hubbell Home (Recommended Action)

Study the effects of visitation and use on both structures, determine detrimental effects, and make recommendations for

mitigating those effects. The goal should be to establish the optimum visitor use balanced against continued preservation of the buildings.

Project Statement Title: Preserve Archeological Sites

C-08

I. Statement of Problem

There are 14 archeological sites identified within the boundaries of the Site. All sites are subject to erosion caused by animal grazing, wind, and water. Vandalism is also a real possibility.

A. Background Information

The cultural affiliations of the sites include prehistoric Basketmaker and Pueblo, historic Navajo, and historic Anglo-American. All sites have been disturbed to some degree by construction, pipelines, farming, and erosion. The Archeological Assessment done in 1978 recommends that no further work be undertaken on any of the sites, with the exception of the following, which due to their locations may be impacted by future development or severe erosion:

MUIR-1: The complex of 10 historic buildings and the associated surface and subsurface deposits make up this site. Both

prehistoric and historic artifacts have been discovered within the area, especially when subsurface disturbance (trenching for gas and water lines) was monitored. The foundations of the Leonard buildings where Hubbell first began his business are also included in this site. HUTR-1 has already been disturbed by subsurface trenching, construction, and plowing.

HUIR-10: This basketmaker III-Pueblo I site is located along a 100-meter area on the western boundary. Part of the site was destroyed by the NPS in excavating fill dirt in 1971. The tributary arroyo which borders the site has contributed to the exposure and erosion of lithic and sherd scatter. Three burials have been excavated from slab-lined cysts since 1975. Possible pithouses have also been located. Although the Archeological Assessment states that the majority of this site lies outside the Site boundary, the exact location of the boundary still remains unclear.

HUIR-14: This Pueblo I - III site is located at the extreme southeast corner of the boundary. A dense concentration of sherds and lithic artifacts was recorded. An irrigation ditch begun by Hubbell was evidently rerouted to the north of the site when cultural material was encountered. The site has been disturbed by some farming and grazing.

HUTR-4: Known as the Sand Dune Site, this multi-component site dating from Pueblo III to contemporary Navajo and Anglo use borders the Pueblo Colorado Wash on its south bank for about 100 meters. A tributary arroyo borders its west end. Although the Arch. Assessment identified no severe erosional problem, it has nevertheless become evident over the past several years that erosion has become severe.

HUTR-5: Wide Reed Ruin is a relatively large Pueblo III ruin with plazas, kivas, and over 50 rooms. It is located on the south bank of the Pueblo Colorado Wash just east of the entrance road bridge. It was partially excavated in the early 1970s to salvage data which was endangered by the cutting of the wash below. Backfilling and bank stabilization, including the placement of gabions below seem to have slowed down the process.

The conditions along the Pueblo Colorado Wash have been greatly improved by a two-phase erosion control project carried out during 1986 and 1987. Even though the rapid erosion of the south bank has been halted for the time-being, this project did nothing to provide any further protection of HUTR-4 and 5, nor did it provide for the stabilization or protection of the other sites.

Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action

All sites are monitored periodically throughout the year for evidence of further erosion and damage by vandalism. Ground disturbing activities are prohibited near the sites, except when such projects have been properly reviewed and determinations made that they will have no adverse effect. Nylon mesh has been laid over some of the sites and an overburden placed on that to better protect the sites and to promote re-vegetation.

B. No Action

This alternative is unacceptable as it implies non-compliance with policy, legislation, regulations, and NPS guidelines which require us to protect archeological remains.

C. Recommended Action

All sites should be thoroughly investigated and evaluated by a competent archeologist to determine their true extent and significance. Alternatives for protecting the sites should be developed and implemented.

Project Statement Title: Research of Hubbell Business

C-06

I. Statement of Problem

Many aspects of the Hubbell business are unknown, or not clearly understood. J. L. Hubbell had many interests and many associations on local, state, and national levels, but just how all of these related and how they affected his business, or vice versa, has yet to be thoroughly researched, analyzed, and interpreted. Until this is done, the project cannot be provided a clear and accurate account of Hubbell the man and his activities at Ganado and elsewhere.

A. Background Information

Other than the farmlands study recently completed, the research conducted on Hubbell Trading Post thus far has been piecemeal and incomplete. There are approximately 100,000 documents relating to the Hubbell business in the archival collection at the University of Arizona. These, for the most part, have not been analyzed.

Some 50 interviews of local inhabitants and Hubbell family members have been conducted by the park staff and are on file. Other information remains scattered in libraries, repositories, state and county records, the Navajo Tribal Research Section, Saint Michaels Mission, and other places.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action (No Action)

No research is being done. Staff members must consult many resources on site for information.

The information base for interpretation and resource management decisions is incomplete, thus contributing to an incomplete and inaccurate interpretation of the site to the public. Permanent exhibits and publications cannot be developed without proper research.

B. Research and Prepare Hubbell Business History (Recommended Action)

Comprehensive research needs to be completed and organized into a written report comprehensible to the layman. The study will be invaluable to interpretive planning, as future interpretive

exhibits and programs depend upon thorough and accurate research. Decision regarding the management of the cultural resources and the present trading business can be made more accurately once this information base is provided.

The following are questions which need to be answered through this research:

1. How did Hubbell's background and personality affect the development of his business and relationship with the Indians?
2. What were the intercultural dynamics involved in trader-Indian interactions?
3. How did the development of events in Ganado relate the development of Hubbell Trading Post?
4. How was Hubbell's business affected by national events, such as the Great Depression, stock reduction, World Wars I and II, the coming of the railroad, automobiles, etc.?
5. What was the development and history of the complex of trading posts owned and operated by Hubbell?
6. How did the Ganado post relate to the other Hubbell posts and vice versa?

7. How did Hubbell's business and approach to Indian trading relate to that of other reservation traders?

8. What was the administrative and business history of the Ganado post from 1876 to 1967? Such aspects as the transportation systems, marketing, advertisement, nature of goods, and competition with other traders will be considered. Comparisons between the operation of the Ganado post and other trading posts will be drawn.

9. What roles did the various members of the Hubbell family play in the business?

10. How did Hubbell's multi-roles as politician, sheriff, and host affect the development of his business?

Project Statement Title: Prepare Historic Furnishings Report

HB-1, 2, and 3

C-10

I. Statement of Problem

There has been no research to document how these buildings were furnished throughout their periods of historic use. Consequently, it is impossible to re-furnish them so as to accurately portray any particular period of occupancy. The most authentic exhibit would have been to leave and maintain everything as it was when Dorothy Hubbell left in 1967. In the strictest sense, any departures from that condition would constitute conjecture. However, for whatever reasons, things were changed around, furnishings removed, and furnishings added. The present furnishings, particularly in the Home, are not reflective of historical conditions at any time and are, in fact, a composite resulting from operational considerations, opinions, and personal tastes of various Park Service staff members who have served here over the years. In short, something of the Hubbell flavor has been maintained, but little accuracy.

A. Background Information

In 1972 David M. Brugge, former park curator, wrote a furnishing plan for the Home. The time period set for the entire Home was pre-1930, to reflect as closely as possible the conditions existing when J. L. Hubbell was living there. Currently, only the hall and the bedrooms make any pretense at adhering to the 1972 plan. The maid's room, bathroom, and cook's room are unfurnished, the dining room is an inaccurate portrayal of the 1960s, and the kitchen displays major furnishings from a variety of periods, but no small ones, which makes for a dead exhibit. All of this adds up to an inaccurate portrayal of the Hubbells and their home.

The Trading Post has never had a furnishings plan prepared. During the past twenty years, things have been rearranged by NPS and SPMA personnel to suit operational needs.

The Barn has a plan, prepared in 1979, but it has never been implemented because of incomplete information and the necessity of using portions of the building for curatorial storage.

There is no comprehensive study documenting the furnishings changes in any of the three buildings.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action

An attempt has been made to implement the 1972 plan for the Home and this effort continues. This is only a partial reaction to a more needed and comprehensive plan including all three buildings. There have been no efforts to re-furnish either the Trading Post or the Barn.

B. Document Furnishing Changes, Prepare Furnishings Report and Implement Plan

1. Prepare written report documenting the changes in historical furnishings for HB-1, 2, and 3.
2. A management decision will be made determining what time period each structure will represent.
3. A furnishings plan will be prepared for each structure to reflect the chosen time period.
4. The furnishing plan will be implemented.

This will result in more accurate exhibits and a more authentic portrayal of the Hubbell family.

Project Statement Title: Prepare Administrative History

C-11

I. Statement of Problem

Hubbell Trading Post NHS has been in existence for twenty years. During that time there have been numerous staff changes, physical developments and changes, preservation projects, and so forth. At present there is no way, other than relying upon the memories of those persons who can be contacted, to learn how, why, and when things were done. Current and future management cannot make the most sound decisions, nor avoid making some of the same mistakes, without having an administrative history.

Also, since MUTR is unique in the National Park System, we do not know just what impacts the establishment of the Site has had upon the local area.

A. Background Information

Although the Site was established by Congress in 1965, for as many as ten years prior to that Arizona national and state

representatives, Dorothy Hubbell, and other interested individuals lobbied hard for the area to become an NPS unit. This effort needs to be documented soon, while most of the participants are still living. Since the Service acquired the site in 1967, there have been nine superintendents and four traders. Each individual has had an effect on the business and the management of the Site. There is no record to document just what these impacts have been. Most, if not all, of these individuals are still available for interview.

The conversion of a long-established trading post on the Navajo Reservation to the status of a National Historic Site must have had impacts on the town of Ganado and the local residents. Has it been beneficial, or an intrusion?

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action

The historical record of the founding and management of this site is now will continue to remain obscure as time passes. This may lead us to misinterpret actions of past superintendents and give inaccurate information to the public regarding the creation of the Site. We need to maintain a steady course in management of these resources and an ability to build our interpretive themes.

B. Prepare Administrative History (Recommended)

Research library sources, newspaper files, NPS files, Congressional records and interview past superintendents, traders, and individuals who helped establish the Site as an NPS unit. Prepare a report summarizing the politics behind the establishment and an overview of management directions, staffing, and significant accomplishments since 1967. Also describe how the various traders have operated the business since 1967 and what changes they have made with regard to trading philosophy, products, interactions with the Indians, and methods of management.

This will provide the Service with a permanent record of the management of the Site and the trading post, as well as the founding of the Site and the philosophy behind its unique operation.

I. Statement of Problem

More ethnographic research is needed, but the exact needs must be identified by competent professional anthropologists.

A. Background Information

Some ethnographic research has already been performed, but further studies are required to round out our understanding of the Navajo culture, the effects of traders on that culture, the effects Hubbell Trading Post has had on the Ganado area, and the ethnological aspects of the local community.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action (No Action)

No ethnological research is being conducted at the present time. Without such research it will continue to be difficult for

management to understand the subtleties of certain aspects of the Navajo culture and how these affect the management and operation of the Site. Likewise, interpretation will be unable to address these factors in programs, exhibits, and literature.

B. Prepare Ethnographic Overview (Recommended)

A survey of existing ethnographic studies should be conducted by a qualified anthropologist and determinations made as to what further research is needed. We note here that whatever studies are prepared should be written for the layman to make them of optimum use to the park staff.

Project Statement Title: Archeological Assessment

C-15

I. Statement of Problem

There are 14 identified archeological sites within the boundaries of Hubbell Trading Post NHS. Beyond locating the sites, no research or investigations have been conducted. Management requires more detailed information as to the significance, extent, and condition of these resources in order to properly care for them.

A. Background Information

An archeological survey of the Site was conducted in 1978. This survey located 14 sites, but did not go into detail as to their precise locations, bounds, and features. For instance, HUTR-1 is the area of the trading post building complex. Sub-surface features are known to be in this area, most importantly the Leonard Buildings of the first trading establishment, but their exact locations have not been determined or evaluated. This information

is vital to the future management, operation, and development of the Historic Site.

II. Alternatives and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Actions

No action is currently being taken to evaluate or further interpret, in an archeological sense, these resources. Without a professional, detailed evaluation the importance and relationships of these sites will remain largely unknown. And, because they have not been well defined, our ability to protect them will remain minimal.

B. Perform an Archeological Evaluation (Recommended)

Conduct a professional evaluation employing remote sensing, field investigation, documentary research, and comparative analysis. The results should be documented in a written report for the use of management. Having such a document will enable management to provide optimum protection of the sites and to provide for possible interpretation of some of them in the future.

Activities and Five-Year Programming Sheet

[illegible]

Part II

NATURAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PROGRAM

Overview and Needs

The major natural resource problem at Hubbell Trading Post NHS has been erosion by rain, wind, and running water. With projects accomplished during 1986-87, the critical problems associated with the Pueblo Colorado Wash have largely been corrected. However, trespass grazing continues to be a problem in that vegetation is depleted and, consequently, rain and wind erosion is promoted. Likewise, such grazing will have to be curtailed before any attempt at restoring the historic scene can be successful.

Project Statement Title: Construct Boundary Fence

N-02

I. Statement of Problem

Privately-owned livestock, including cattle, goats, and sheep, enter the Historic Site, where they wander almost at will over archeological resources, on the entrance road, in the employee housing area, on the banks of the washes, and in the fields. Beyond being a nuisance, these animals eat every bit of vegetation they can find. As a result, the light, loamy soil is eroded rapidly by both wind, rain, and the mechanical action of the animal's hooves.

A. Background Information

Many parts of the Navajo Reservation are classed as "open grazing" and even where fences exist, livestock owners are not overly concerned about keeping their stock confined. The Historic Site's boundary is presently fenced, but much of this is very old and has numerous gaps and droops. Also, the fencing is for the most part four-strand wire, whereas it needs to be woven wire to be

effective. Some system needs to be devised to prevent livestock from entering the Site through the washes, yet not pose a problem with water-carried debris.

II. Alternative Actions and Probable Impacts

A. Current Management Action

Existing fences are maintained as well as possible, but materials are old and of the wrong type. Whenever possible, the owners of trespass livestock are found and advised to remove the animals, but this is not always successful. We have also worked through the Ganado Chapter to notify owners not to allow their stock to roam inside the Historic Site. This has helped somewhat, but has certainly not eliminated the problem, especially in the warm seasons of the year.

B. Design and Construct New Boundary Fence

Since it seems to be a "given" that livestock owners are not going to keep their animals confined, the only alternative is that the NPS fence its boundary effectively.

Natural Resources

Activities and Five Year Programming Sheet

<u>Project Title</u>	<u>Priority</u>	1988		1989		1990		1991		1992	
		<u>M.Y.</u>	<u>Cost</u>	<u>M.Y.</u>	<u>Cost</u>	<u>M.Y.</u>	<u>Cost</u>	<u>M.Y.</u>	<u>Cost</u>	<u>M.Y.</u>	<u>Cost</u>
Boundary Fence	1	1.0	\$30,000								

Finding of No Significant Impact

Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site

Determination: It is determined that all actions outlined within this document are maintenance and research in character and do not significantly affect the natural environment. Therefore, in accordance with the following paragraph from Environmental Assessments and Statements Guidelines (NPS-12),

"Routine maintenance and operation of parks, small changes in programs for managing resources and providing for visitor use, and similar continuously occurring minor actions -- must be taken in ways that ensure protection and enhancement of environmental impacts is not required."

No Environmental Assessment will be prepared.

Recommended By:

Chief, Natural Resources, SW Region Date

Recommended By:

Chief, SW Cultural Resources Center Date

Concurred By:

Associate Regional Director, Operations Date

Approved By:

Regional Director, Southwest Region Date

C. BIBLIOGRAPHY

HUBBELL TRADING POST

"Hubbell Trading Post at Ganado," The Santa Fe Magazine, Dec. 1965,
HTP-M-24.

"Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site," Arizona Highways,
September 1967, HTP-M-22.

Catalogue and Price List - Navajo Blankets and Indian Curios,
HTP-M-16.

"The Hubbell Trading Post at Ganado," Plateau, April 1953,
HIP-M-10.

"History of Ganado, Arizona," Museum Notes, April 1934, HTP-M-9.

"Fifty Years an Indian Trader," Touring Topics, Dec. 1930,
HTP-M-7.

"White Brother of the Navajo," Colliers, April 1943, HTP-M-6.

"The Story of Don Lorenzo," The Arizona Republic, Dec. 1965,
HTP-M-5.

"The Hubbell Trading Post at Ganado," Arizona Highways, Aug. 1950,
HTP-M-3.

"John Lorenzo Hubbell," in More Arizona Characters, pp.53-79,
HIP-M-2.

"Don Lorenzo Hubbell of Ganado," Arizona Historical Review,
April 1931, HTP-M-1.

"Greatest Patron of Navajo Artistry in Ruq Weaving Dies," The
Denver Post, Nov. 1930, HTP-N-3.

"Many Noted People Mourn the Death of Don Lorenzo," Winslow Daily
Mail, Dec. 1930, HTP-N-5.

"Don Lorenzo Hubbell, One of the Great," Arizona News, May 1963,
HTP-N-20.

Desert Wife, Extract in cruator's files.

As it Was Then, manuscript in curator's files.

Interviews with Mrs. Dorothy S. Hubbell, 13-24 Oct. 1969, manuscript
in curator's files.

Bourke, John G., The Snake Dance of the Moquis of Arizona, The Rio
Grande Press, Inc., 1962.

Judd, Neil M., Men Met Along the Trail, University of Oklahoma Press,
Norman, Olka 1968.

Interpretive Prospectus for Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site.

Hubbell Trading Post Historic Structures Report Part II, Historical Eat:
Section.

Field Investigation Report - J.L. Hubbell Trading Post, Ganado, Arizona.

Part I Historic Structures Report, Hubbell Trading Post National Historic
Site

FICTION INSPIRED BY HUBBELL

Coolidge, Dane, Lorenzo the Magnificent.

"Delmar of Pima," McClure's, Feb. 1902, HTP-M-8.

ART COLLECTION

Burbank, E.A. and Ernest Royce, Burbank Among the Indians, The Caxton
Printers, LTD, 1944'.

Perceval, Don, Maynard Dixon Sketch Book, The Northland Press, Flagstaff,
Arizona, 1967.

Wolosnuk, Nicholas Jr., Edward Borein, Drawings and Paintings of the Old
West. The Northland Press, Flagstaff, Arizona 1968.

"Free Man in a Free Country," The American West, Nov. 1969.

The Frederick Monsen Expeditions, HTP-M-27.

"Elbridge Ayer Burbank, 1858-1949," The Pony Express, March 1966,
HIP-M-19.

"E.A. Burbank, Indian Painter," Los Angeles Sunday Times, March 25,
1900, HTP-M-18.

"Portrait of Our Lady," Our Sunday Visitor, June 1963, HTP-M-14.

"Guadalupe Gleanings," Our Sunday Visitor, June 1963, NPT-M-15.

"Sagebrush Rembrandt," Colliers, 1950, HTP-M-12.

Letter re: Burbank works at Gilcrease Institute, HTP-N-8.

"Elbridge A. Burbank, A painter of American Indians," Town and Country Review, HTP-N-9.

"American Art - The Influence of Elbridge Ayer Burbank," Town and Country, HIP-N-10.

"The West Lives Again in Hearts of Collectors," The National Observer,
Dec. 1969, NTP-N-23.

Manhood, Ruth I., Photographer of the Southwest, Adam Clark Vroman,
1956-1916. The Ward Ritchie Press, 1961.

"E. A. Burbank: Painter of Indians, 1858-1949," The Westerners Brand Book, pp. 90-114.

GANADO MISSION

"Historical Sketch of Ganado Mission, Ganado, Arizona," HTP-M-25.

"Navajo Oasis---The Ganado Mission," Sunset, June 1962, HTP-M-21.

Means, Florence Cranwell, Sagebrush Surgeon. Friendship Press, Inc.
New York, 1955.

Salsbury, Clarence G., The Salsbury Story. The University of Arizona Press, Tucson, Arizona, 1969.

Wallis, Ethel Emily, God Speaks Navajo. Harper & Row, New York, 1968.

Allen, T. D., Navajos Have Five Fingers.

Ganado Mission to the Navajos, HTP-M-17.

NAVAJOS AT GANADO

"Ganado Mucho, Navajo Naat'aani," The Navajo Times, Parts 1, 2 & 3, HTP-N-14.

Hogan School, manuscript in curator's files.

Reichard, Gladys A., Spider Woman. The Rio Grande Press, Inc., Glorieta, New Mexico, 1968.

Reichard, Gladys A., Navajo Medicine Man. (Hubbell Collection)

Reports Relating to Hubbell Trading Post NHS

1. Background Book, Proposed Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site. 89th Congress.
2. Brugge, David M., Furnishings Study, Hubbell Home, 1972.
3. Brugge, David M., Furnishings Plan for the Hubbell Home, 1973.
4. Cook, John E. and William E. Brown, Historic Structures Reports, Part I, Hubbell Trading Post NHS, 1966.
5. Cook, John E. and William E. Brown, Interpretive Prospectus for Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site, 1967
6. Grant, Paige, Water Resources Management Profile, 1982.
7. Koue, A. Lewis and Robert V. Simmonds, Historic Structures Report, Part II, Trading Post, HB-1, and Wareroom Extension, HB-2, 1970.
8. Koue, A. Lewis and Robert V. Simmonds, Historic Structures Report, Part II, Hubbell Home, HB-2, 1971.

9. Koue, A. Lewis and Robert V. Simmonds, Historic Structures Report, Part II, Bread Oven, HB-2, 1971.
10. Levy, Benjamin, Hubbell Trading Post, Historic Structures Report, Part II, Historical Data Section, 1968.
11. Morris, Don P., Stabilization Report, HB-9, 1969.
12. Peterson, Charles S., Homestead and Farm: A History of Farming at the Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site, 1986.
13. Utley, Robert M. The National Survey of Historic Sites and Buildings, Special Report on Hubbell Trading Post, Ganado, Arizona, 1959.
14. Westley, Volney J., William E. Brown, John E. Cook, and Wes Wolfe, Master Plan for Hubbell Trading Post National Historic Site, 1969.
15. Wing, Kittredge A. Charlie Steen, Field Investigation Report, J. L. Hubbell Trading Post, Ganado, Arizona, 1958.