

PRELIMINARY HISTORIC DISTRICT STUDY COMMITTEE REPORT
WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT
CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND, MICHIGAN
2011

CHARGE OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT STUDY COMMITTEE

On June 30, 2010, Mackinac Island City Council appointed a study committee to study a downtown historic district. The study area was defined as follows: the downtown district of Mackinac Island bounded by Market Street from Fort Street to Main Street; Main Street from Fort Street to the school; Mahoney Avenue from Main Street to Cadotte Avenue; Cadotte Avenue from Mahoney Avenue to Market Street; the entire cross streets between those streets listed above and all properties on both sides of the above mentioned streets.

STUDY COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Sam Barnwell, city council member and property owner in downtown study area

Brad Chambers, property owner and resident of downtown study area

Michael Hart, city council member, historic preservation advocate, resident of study area

Steve Moskwa, property owner in downtown study area; worked on city zoning ordinance

Dan Wightman, member of city council, planning commission, and historic preservation committee; involved in passing local historic district ordinance

Jennifer Metz, Past Perfect, Inc., Jane C. Busch, PhD, and Eric Gollannek, PhD, historic preservation consultants, and **Lisa Craig Brisson**, historian, assisted the study committee in its work. Dr. Busch meets federal professional qualification requirements for historian and architectural historian; Dr. Gollannek and Ms. Metz meet the requirements for architectural historian. Ms. Brisson meets the requirements for historian.

INVENTORY

A photographic inventory of the proposed district was conducted between October and December 2010.

DESCRIPTION OF THE DISTRICT

The proposed West End Historic District is located at the southwestern end of Mackinac Island, beginning at the western edge of Windermere (formerly Biddle) Point property and extending westward to the grounds of the Grand Hotel. The district consists of the western portion of the village of Mackinac Island, which was developed beginning in the early nineteenth century as the village spread beyond its original boundaries. The district is roughly

triangular in shape. Lake Huron borders the district on the south. Huron (Main) Street (photo 1) follows the lakeshore.¹ A boardwalk between Huron Street and the lake has been at its current location since at least the 1920s. Cadotte Avenue (photo 2), roughly parallel to Huron Street, bounds the district on the north. Market Street (photo 3) and Mahoney Street (photo 4) are the two cross streets. Toward the east end of the district, Bourisaw Lane (photo 5) extends a short distance inland from Huron Street. The West End Historic District is not as densely developed as the adjoining Market and Main (Huron) Historic District; it has fewer streets and more open space. West End is almost wholly residential. Excepting a few outbuildings, the only non-residential contributing buildings are a commercial stable, a church, and a school. A restaurant on Cadotte Avenue was built ca. 1970. On the lakeshore, a library, residence, and a pumping station were built in the 1980s.

The earliest houses in the district are built of logs. The first story of the William Backhouse Astor House (1441 Cadotte Avenue; photo 6) is log, believed to have been built ca. 1816. The construction, however, differs from other French colonial log houses on the island; instead it is similar to the Officers' Wooden Quarters built at Fort Mackinac that year.² The two upper stories and Queen Anne-style details were added in the late nineteenth century. Two French colonial log buildings are located at the eastern end of the district, near the original village. The two houses built ca. 1820 at 1282 (photo 7) and 1294 Bourisaw Lane are side-gabled, the most common form.

The John Biddle House (ca. 1822; photo 8) at 7790 Huron Street is a two-story, side-gabled house with a side passage—the only example of this type on the island. The house has later additions and a twentieth-century Colonial Revival doorway. It was originally located near Windermere (formerly Biddle) Point and was moved to its current location in 1887 to make way for the Anthony Cottage, which became the Windermere Hotel.

The majority of the houses in the district date from the mid-nineteenth to early twentieth century. The most common form is the two-story, front-gabled house, sometimes with a wing and almost always with a front porch. Decorative detailing tends to be limited, perhaps turned posts on the porch or shingles in the gable end. Two houses built ca. 1880 at 7664 and 7656 Huron Street (photo 9) are well-preserved examples of the type. There are a small number of one-, one-and-a-half-, and two-story side-gabled houses. The house at 7639 Market Street (ca. 1870; photo 10) acquired a Craftsman appearance when the porch was enclosed in the early twentieth century. One foursquare house dating to the early 1900s is located at 7587 Market Street (photo 11).

The larger summer cottages tend to have more complex forms, either cross-gabled or irregular. Most of the larger cottages are located on Huron Street facing the lake; this is also where styles are most evident. The house at 7742 Huron Street (ca. 1900; photo 12) is a cross-gabled house in the Queen Anne style, with decorative shingles, columned first- and second-story porches, and a tower on the side. The second-story porch was recently enclosed. The house at 7566

¹ Huron Street is the historic name; today the official name is Main Street.

² Phil Porter, "Log Cabin Research Notes," 1988, vertical file, Petersen Center Library, Mackinac State Historic Parks.

Huron Street (ca. 1890; photo 13) is a textbook example of the Queen Anne style, with its corner tower, wraparound porch, and mix of shingles and clapboard. Corner Cottage, at 7714 Huron Street (ca. 1900; photo 14) is an eclectic composition with Chippendale balustrade and fluted Doric columns on the front porch; bracketed eaves; and modillion blocks and three types of shingles in the front gable. The Patrick Doud House (1899; photo 15) at 7634 Huron Street, attributed to noted island builder Patrick Doud, is an eye-catching example of the Shingle Style, two-and-a-half stories with prominent dormer windows and arched openings in a full-width front porch.

Two houses were built in the district ca. 1960: a modern beach house at 7790 Huron Street and a Cape Cod house at 7768 Huron Street (photo 16). The latter is unusual on the island in its use of brick veneer. Five houses built in the district subsequent to the period of significance are mostly Victorian Revival style.

Four contributing outbuildings—two barns and two sheds—have been identified in the district. These four are visible reminders of the much larger number of outbuildings that were there historically. They typically have minor alterations, but overall maintain their historic character. The shed at 7704 Mahoney Street (photo 17) is a representative example.

Jack's Livery Stable at 7754 Mahoney Street (photo 18) is the only commercial stable in the district and one of five commercial stables in the village. The six buildings that make up the complex include barns and a farrier's workshop. They were probably built roughly between the 1920s and 1950s; some may have been moved to the site in the 1950s.

At the western edge of the district there are two distinctive buildings: a church and a school. The Little Stone Church (1904; photo 19) at 1590 Cadotte Avenue is the only church in the district and one of four on the island. The Gothic Revival church with bell cote is unusual for the island in its fieldstone construction; it contains stained glass windows depicting events in island history. The Mackinac Island Public School (ca. 1961; photo 20) at 7846 Huron Street is the largest building in the district, a Colonial Revival school with brick veneer, entrance portico, and hipped roof with cupola.

RESOURCE LIST

Huron Street—the historic street name—is used in the resource list; the current name for Huron Street is Main Street.

Address	Street Name	Historic Name	Current Name	District Status	Year Built
1271	Bourisaw Lane	LaPine House	Ron Dufina House	Non-Contributing	1856
1282	Bourisaw Lane	Bourisaw House	Bourisaw House	Contributing	c. 1820

1289	Bourisaw Lane	Dufina House	Ron and Judy Dufina House	Contributing	c. 1880
1294	Bourisaw Lane	Frank Dufina House	Judy Bynoe House	Contributing	c. 1820
1299	Bourisaw Lane	Karhoff House	Alexander Dufina House	Contributing	c. 1850-60s
1395	Cadotte	May House	Davis House	Contributing	c. 1900
1401	Cadotte			Non-Contributing	c. 1988
1413	Cadotte			Non-Contributing	c. 1988
1423	Cadotte			Contributing	c. 1900
1441	Cadotte	William Backhouse Astor House	Grand Cottage	Contributing	c. 1816
1441 A	Cadotte		Grand Cottage stable building	Contributing	c. 1920
1446	Cadotte	Thomas Chambers House		Contributing	c. 1850s
1503	Cadotte	Bon Air Cottage and Rooming House	Big House	Contributing	c. 1890
1510	Cadotte	Frank T. Chambers House		Contributing	1899
1542	Cadotte	McIntyre House	Dr. Orr House	Contributing	1897
1547	Cadotte	French Outpost	Grand Hotel Gate House	Non-Contributing	c. 1970
1550	Cadotte		Either Orr Cottage	Non-Contributing	2010
1590	Cadotte	Union Congregational Church	Little Stone Church	Contributing	1904

7528	Huron	Nicolet Tea Room	Jeanette Doud House	Contributing	c. 1900
7549	Huron		Mackinac Island Library	Non-Contributing	1988
7566	Huron			Contributing	c. 1890
7575	Huron		Boardwalk Cottage	Non-Contributing	1984
7592	Huron	Villa du Lac		Contributing	c. 1890
7595	Huron		Pumping Station	Non-Contributing	c. 1980
7614	Huron	Werner Tea Room		Contributing	c. 1891
7634	Huron	Patrick Doud Cottage	Lakewood Cottage	Contributing	1899
7656	Huron			Contributing	c. 1880
7656 A	Huron			Contributing	c. 1900
7664	Huron			Contributing	c. 1880
7670	Huron		Cable Cottage	Contributing	c. 1900
7714	Huron	Corner Cottage		Contributing	c. 1900
7714 A	Huron	Corner Cottage Guest House		Contributing	c. 1900
7742	Huron		Stonesthrow Cottage	Contributing	c. 1900
7752	Huron			Contributing	c. 1900
7768	Huron			Contributing	c. 1960
7790	Huron	John Biddle House	Musser House	Contributing	c. 1820
7790 A	Huron		Musser Beach House	Contributing	c. 1950s
7810	Huron		Musser House	Contributing	c. 1850s
7822	Huron			Non-Contributing	c. 2000
7834	Huron			Contributing	c. 1890
7838	Huron			Contributing	c. 1900

7846	Huron		Mackinac Island School	Contributing	c. 1961
7846 A	Huron		Mackinac Island School	Non-Contributing	c. 1970
7675	Mahoney			Non-Contributing	c. 1970
7685	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1900
7692	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1920
7695	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1930
7701	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1900
7704	Mahoney			Non-Contributing	c. 1860
7704 A	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1900
7707	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1900
7723	Mahoney	Corrigan House		Contributing	c. 1900
7726	Mahoney	May House		Contributing	c. 1900
7736	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1800-1900
7740	Mahoney			Contributing	c. 1900
7745	Mahoney	McCarty House		Contributing	c. 1900
7754 A	Mahoney	Goughs	Jack's Livery	Contributing	c.1920s-40s
7754 B	Mahoney	Goughs	Jack's Livery	Contributing	c.1920s-40s
7754 C	Mahoney	Goughs	Jack's Livery	Contributing	c.1920s-40s
7754 D	Mahoney	Goughs	Jack's Livery	Contributing	c.1920s-40s
7778	Mahoney			Non-Contributing	c. 1990
7587	Market			Contributing	c. 1900
7597	Market		Geranium Cottage	Contributing	c. 1900
7609	Market		Emerson's House on Benjamin Hill	Contributing	c. 1900
7639	Market			Contributing	c. 1870
7649	Market			Contributing	c. 1870

COUNT AND PERCENTAGE OF HISTORIC AND NON-HISTORIC RESOURCES

There are fifty-three contributing (historic) and thirteen non-contributing (non-historic) resources in the district. Contributing resources account for 80 percent of the total.

BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION

The West End Historic District is bounded on the south by Lake Huron; on the northeast by a line extending from the western edge of Windermere Point property along the southwest lot lines of parcels 051-575-047-00, 051-575-018-00, 051-575-016-00, 051-575-014-00, 051-575-013-00, 051-575-010-00, 051-575-007-00, 051-575-006-00, and continuing another 26 feet; thence northeast to the rear lot line of parcel 051-575-005-00; thence northwestward along the rear lot lines of the properties on the north side of Cadotte Avenue; and on the west by the Mackinac Island Public School, included.

BOUNDARY JUSTIFICATION

The eastern boundary of the West End Historic District coincides with the western boundary of the Market and Main (Huron) Historic District, which marks the western boundary of the original village as laid out by the British ca. 1780 and historic Biddle Point. The West End Historic District contains the western portion of the village, developed beginning in the early nineteenth century when the village spread beyond its original boundaries. In contrast to the mix of commercial, civic, and residential buildings in the Market and Main (Huron) District, the West End District is almost wholly residential. To the north of the district is the Grand Hotel's golf course. Open space to the west marks the former Borough Lot, leased by the Grand Hotel from the city. On the south, the district extends to the lakeshore. Though largely undeveloped, the lakeshore is an inseparable part of the historic landscape. For this reason, the National Historic Landmark boundaries for the island extend to the lakeshore. When fishermen lived in the West End district, the lakeshore was probably used for work activities. When summer cottages were built along Huron Street, the lakeshore became a place for leisure activity. The boardwalk that has been there since at least the 1920s is evidence of leisure strolling along the lakeshore.

HISTORY OF THE DISTRICT

Before the first Europeans saw Mackinac Island, it was an important gathering place for Native Americans who came there to fish and imbued the island's limestone formations and cliffs with sacred significance. Historical and archaeological evidence suggests that the island's inhabitants have always clustered near Haldimand Bay. In the late seventeenth century, French fur traders and Jesuit missionaries came to the Straits of Mackinac because of its strategic location and because it was already an Indian gathering place. Father Jacques Marquette and a band of refugee Huron established the first mission on Mackinac Island in 1671. But the soil was unsuitable for their crops, and within the year they moved to the north shore of the straits and established their mission at what is now the city of St. Ignace. By the 1680s, St. Ignace

was a center of activity for the Jesuits, fur traders, and French soldiers who built Fort DuBuade. The fur traders established a trading pattern that made the Straits of Mackinac the heart of the upper Great Lakes fur trade for 150 years. In 1697 the French government abandoned Fort DuBuade in response to a glut in the European fur market. When French soldiers returned to the straits in 1714, the Jesuits and their followers had moved to the south shore of the straits, and there the soldiers built Fort Michilimackinac. In 1761 the British took command of Fort Michilimackinac as a result of the Seven Years' War.

With the outbreak of the American Revolution, British officials became concerned that the accessible, wooden palisaded Fort Michilimackinac would not withstand an American attack. In October 1779, Michilimackinac's new commander, Lieutenant Governor Patrick Sinclair, developed plans to move the fort to Mackinac Island and began negotiations to purchase the island from Ojibway chiefs. The move began in the winter of 1779–80. As the location for the fort, Sinclair chose the 150-foot bluff overlooking the harbor and south shore, where he located the village. Sinclair knew this left the fort vulnerable to attack from the higher bluff to the north, but it allowed him to protect the village and harbor. The location of the village outside the fort walls, a departure from the situation at Michilimackinac, was intended to enhance military security. Nevertheless, the village had wooden palisade walls of its own on the north, west and south sides; the bay was on the east. To entice the villagers to move to the island, Sinclair ordered Ste. Anne Church to be shipped over the ice by ox-drawn sleds. Other buildings were moved across the ice as well. Although the British were in command, the civilian population in the village consisted predominantly of French fur traders, their Odawa and Ojibway wives, and their Métis (mixed-blood) offspring.

Although the 1783 Treaty of Paris put Mackinac Island in the United States, American soldiers did not occupy Fort Mackinac until 1796. In the peaceful period following the Treaty of Paris, people began to move outside of the village walls, building homes to the south and west side of Haldimand Bay and establishing small farms in the interior. Cadotte Avenue was one of several roads built into the interior of the island. Even after 1796, British merchants continued to control the fur trade, while French and Métis traders conducted most of the actual trading. Not surprisingly, the early architecture of the village was French colonial in form and construction. Reports of the number of buildings in the village between 1796 and 1802 are variable, ranging from about fifty to eighty-nine. In the winter only about half of the houses were occupied, but the summer population of a thousand or more filled all of the houses and spilled over into tents.³ In 1811, John Jacob Astor's American Fur Company merged with the Montreal Michilimackinac Company, making Astor the first American with a share of the Great Lakes fur trade. Then in July 1812, in the first land action of the War of 1812, the British captured Fort Mackinac. As the westernmost of a line of forts on the border between the U.S. and Canada, the northernmost fort on the western frontier, and the grand depot for the fur trade, Fort Mackinac was a key defensive post. In December 1814 the Treaty of Ghent ended the war, returning Fort Mackinac to the Americans, who reoccupied the fort in July 1815.

³ Jane C. Busch, "Mackinac Island National Historic Landmark Nomination" (Washington, D.C.: National Historic Landmarks Survey, 1999), 71.

After the war, Astor reestablished Mackinac Island as the American Fur Company's center for interior operations and quickly came to dominate the flourishing fur trade. The scale and complexity of Astor's trading empire was unprecedented. Ramsey Crooks, Astor's partner and general manager, and Robert Stuart, resident manager, supervised the American Fur Company's Mackinac Island operation. Some independent traders—including Michael Dousman and partners Edward Biddle and John Drew—had headquarters on Mackinac Island as well. The trading pattern was much the same as in the late seventeenth century. During the winter, French Canadian and Métis traders spread through the Great Lakes region trading for furs with Indian trappers. In the summer, traders returned with their pelts to Mackinac Island, where company clerks counted, sorted, graded, and packed the pelts to ship back to New York City. The traders obtained a new supply of trade goods for the next winter's trading. During this summer rendezvous, the island's permanent population of about five hundred grew to about two thousand with visiting traders and trappers as well as Native Americans from many nations who came to do business with the U.S. Indian Agent.⁴ By then, the palisade walls around the village were gone, and houses were built to the south and west of the original village boundaries. Whereas the northeastern end of the village was separated from the original settlement by the government grounds below Fort Mackinac, the south and western end was continuous. An 1817 map shows a few houses on Market and Huron streets in the west end.

In the 1830s the decline of the fur trade ushered in a time of change for Mackinac Island. In 1834 Astor sold the American Fur Company to a group of investors led by Ramsey Crooks, who moved the company's inland headquarters to LaPointe, Wisconsin, reducing, though not eliminating, Mackinac's role in the fur trade. Crooks was successful at first, but in 1842 a combination of factors led him to declare bankruptcy. During this time, commercial fishing emerged as the island's primary industry. The 1825 opening of the Erie Canal and the introduction of steamboats on the Great Lakes made travel to the upper midwest faster and easier, fostering permanent settlement in the region. Mackinac Island became a fish processing and shipping center for the northern Lake Michigan and Lake Huron region. Schooners and steamers transported the fish to markets in the region's growing villages and cities. Although the island never had the prominence in fishing that it had in the fur trade, the fishing industry provided a strong economic basis for Mackinac until at least the Civil War. New docks and warehouses were built on the lakeshore. Leading fish merchants included Michael Dousman, Biddle and Drew, William Scott, Toll and Rice, Bromilow and Bates, and James Bennett. Barrel-making and repair became an important subsidiary industry; more than thirty coopers—many of them from Scotland, Ireland, and Canada—worked on the island in 1850.⁵ Among them was the Doud family of coopers from Ireland. The fishermen themselves were mostly Native American and Métis. An unpleasant offshoot of the fishing industry, however, was the fish remains left after the fish were cleaned and dressed. In 1853 the village government prohibited the cleaning and dressing of fish within village limits and restricted the dumping of fish offal to the Borough Lot—what is now open land just west of the school, bordering the West End district. Fishermen subsequently built a shanty town on the Borough Lot.

⁴ Phil Porter, *Mackinac: An Island Famous in These Regions* (Mackinac Island: Mackinac State Historic Parks, 1998), 27.

⁵ *Ibid.*, 35.

Furs and fish were not the only goods shipped through the Straits of Mackinac. The straits was a primary Great Lakes shipping lane, and freight of all kinds was transshipped from the port on Haldimand Bay. As steamboats became more common, Mackinac functioned as a fueling station, selling wood at first and later coal. Another boost to the island's economy came from the 1836 Treaty of Washington. Under the terms of this treaty, Ojibway and Odawa Indians sold fifteen million acres of land in Michigan to the U.S. government in exchange for money, goods, and provisions to be paid over the next twenty years. The American Fur Company and other island merchants successfully convinced the government to make these distributions on Mackinac Island. Thus each year in late summer approximately four thousand Ojibway and Odawa came to Mackinac Island to receive their annuities in cash, goods, and provisions.

The arrival of Mackinac Island's first tourists in the 1830s contributed to the diversification of the island's economy. Travelers were beginning to seek resorts that offered scenic beauty, not just healthy water and air as was the custom earlier. The romantic movement introduced a new appreciation for the beauty of nature and wilderness landscapes, bringing tourists to places like Niagara Falls and the Catskill Mountains. Mackinac Island combined the health advantages of the lakeshore with the rugged beauty of the wilderness. A number of writers visited the island in the 1830s and 1840s, including Harriet Martineau, Alexis DeTocqueville, Anna Jameson, Margaret Fuller, and William Cullen Bryant. Their published descriptions of Mackinac Island helped to popularize the island as a tourist destination. The steamboats that were being used to transport fish and furs made it easier for visitors to come to Mackinac Island, though it was still a journey, and island businesses were just beginning to cater to the tourist trade. Older buildings were converted to hotels, and new hotels were built. A horse-drawn omnibus offered tours of natural and historic sites as early as the 1840s, and shops in town began carrying "Indian curiosities" such as baskets, corn husk dolls, woven mats, and birch bark containers of maple sugar.

By 1850 Mackinac Island's permanent population had grown to 956. Immigrants came from New England and New York. Twelve African-Americans came from Kentucky and Virginia. A growing number of islanders were foreign-born, coming from England, Scotland, Canada, Belgium, Prussia, Germany, and Holland. The largest group of immigrants came from Ireland—pushed by the potato famine that brought more than one million Irish to America and pulled by the opportunities in the island's fishing industry. By 1850 the Irish constituted almost 20 percent of the island's population.⁶ Irishman John Mahoney purchased land in the west end of the village and subdivided it, creating Mahoney Street. An 1855 map shows as many as forty structures between French Lane and the Borough Lot. Irish families clustered in the west end: the 1860 census shows approximately twenty of the thirty-three Irish households on the island living there.⁷

After the Civil War, Mackinac Island quickly rose to prominence as one of the most popular resorts in the Midwest. Improved transportation was key in bringing more visitors to the

⁶ Ibid., 41.

⁷ Linnie Thuma, "An Island Refuge: The Irish on Mackinac Island, Michigan from 1840 to 1900" (master's thesis, Cooperstown Graduate Program, 1981), 29.

island. In 1875 the Grand Rapids and Indiana Railroad completed a railroad line to Petoskey, where travelers could board a steamer to Mackinac Island. In 1882 both the Grand Rapids and Indiana Railroad and the Michigan Central Railroad completed railroad lines to Mackinaw City, where ferry boats were available to complete the short trip to the island. In the same year, the Detroit and Cleveland Steam Navigation Company began regular service to Mackinac Island. Vacationers in this era continued to seek a healthy and inspiring environment, but there was increasing emphasis on recreation. Scenic views and limestone formations, historic sites from the War of 1812, the harbor that still sheltered sailboats and Indian canoes, the quaint old French houses in the village, and Fort Mackinac itself all offered diversions for tourists. In his 1875 guide book to Mackinac Island, J. Disturnell recounted many of the island's Indian legends, an important part of Mackinac's attraction. In the guidebook's business directory, four stores list Indian curiosities along with their dry goods, groceries, and provisions.⁸ There was a growing complement of boardinghouses and hotels.

The island's importance as a resort solidified with the establishment of America's second national park on Mackinac Island in 1875. The national park, which encompassed about 50 percent of the island, gave new purpose to Fort Mackinac, which had long ceased to have strategic importance as a frontier or border post. Now the fort commandant served as the park superintendent, responsible for enforcing rules and regulations, building roads and trails, collecting and disbursing park funds, and leasing lots for cottages. On the west side of the island, Hubbard's Annex was platted in 1882 as Mackinac Island's first cottage resort community, followed by cottages on the East and West Bluffs. When a partnership of railroad and steamship lines built the Grand Hotel in 1887, Mackinac Island entered the category of fashionable resort where Newport, Rhode Island, and Saratoga Springs, New York, set the standard. Construction of the Grand had an immediate impact on the west end of the village. The owner of the hotel insisted on removal of the shanty town on the Borough Lot. Many shanty town residents moved to a new community on the island interior, later known as Harrisonville. A number of former coopers, who no longer had work in the fishing industry, worked on construction of the Grand Hotel and later continued work in the carpentry trade. Among them was Patrick Doud, who would go on to construct a number of homes for wealthy cottagers.

Mackinac Island faced a crisis in the 1890s when the army decided to close Fort Mackinac and sell the national park. Secretary of War Daniel Lamont believed that the government should not be responsible for maintaining a summer resort for wealthy people. Islanders successfully lobbied Congress to transfer the national park to the state of Michigan, and in 1895 the country's second national park became Michigan's first state park, administered by the new Mackinac Island State Park Commission. Mackinac Island continued to grow and prosper as a resort, as evidenced by the predominance of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century buildings on the island today. The village experienced substantial development to the northeast and southwest of its original boundaries, consisting of homes plus a few hotels and large boardinghouses. On the west end of Huron Street, the early log houses were removed and replaced with summer cottages. Brothers Charles and Clifford Anthony, investment bankers from Peoria, Illinois, built a Queen Anne-style cottage at Biddle (now Windermere)

⁸ J. Disturnell, *Island of Mackinac and Its Vicinity* (1875; reprint, Cheboygan, Mich.: C. W. Page, 1977).

Point (7498 Huron) in 1887. About 1900 they sold this cottage and moved to two new cottages, Charles to Corner Cottage (7714 Huron) and Clifford to a Shingle Style cottage (7634 Huron) built by Patrick Doud. Some houses were turned into boardinghouses, such as the Bon Air Cottage (1503 Cadotte) and Doud Cottage (William Backhouse Astor House, 1441 Cadotte), which acquired two additional stories.

The island was modernized with electricity, running water, and telephones, along with telephone poles, a coal-burning electric plant, and a water-pumping station. When the first automobile appeared in the village in 1898, the islanders drew the line. The village council banned automobiles on village streets, and in 1901 the park commission banned automobiles in the park. As is often the case, the disappearance of the island's historic buildings generated interest in their history. Residents and cottagers wrote books on Mackinac Island history and erected historical monuments. In 1895, a group of islanders restored the Mission Church (extant, not in district). In 1905, the park commission opened Marquette Park in the former soldiers' garden below the fort, and in 1909 dedicated the bronze statue of Father Marquette that still stands in the park.

The tourism-based prosperity that began on Mackinac Island in the late nineteenth century continued through the 1920s. During World War I, however, new construction slowed, and it diminished further in the 1920s. The Grand Hotel was an exception—an addition was built in 1912, a golf course in 1917, and in the 1920s a fifth floor was added and an outdoor swimming pool constructed. Certainly this was evidence of wealth continuing to flow to Mackinac Island. Another indicator was Mackinac Island State Park's acquisition of several hundred acres during the 1920s. After World War I, a steadily growing number of visitors travelled to the island by auto instead of by railroad or steamboat. Two of Michigan's improved highways, the East and West Michigan Pikes, met in Mackinaw City in 1922. The following year the state began operating an automobile ferry across the straits from Mackinaw City to St. Ignace. But these developments had a greater impact on mainland tourism than on the island. In an effort to lure more auto tourists from the mainland, the state park's Superintendent Frank Kenyon proposed an auto garage on Mackinac Island where people could leave their cars while they toured the island, but it never came to fruition. Although illegal automobiles occasionally appeared on the island, and the ordinances prohibiting automobiles were challenged, they were not overturned.

The Depression slowed resort life on Mackinac Island. In the 1930s, tourism dwindled to a trickle, stores on Huron Street were vacant, some cottages on the bluffs were boarded up and overgrown, and the Grand Hotel came close to bankruptcy. A measure of relief came from federal and local public programs. The Civilian Conservation Corps undertook landscaping projects, repaired buildings at Fort Mackinac, reconstructed Fort Holmes, and built the scout barracks. Under the federal Public Works Act, an airport landing strip was built near the center of the island. Works Projects Administration (WPA) funds were used to hire Grand Rapids architect Warren Rindge to prepare a detailed historical and architectural report on the island's historic buildings.⁹ A local public works program was initiated by the City of Mackinac Island

⁹ Warren L. Rindge, "National Park Service Report on Fort Mackinac Restoration, Mackinac Island, Michigan." Unpublished report dated November 1, 1934. Copy in collections of Mackinac State Historic Parks.

when it created the Park and Harbor Commission in 1941. By selling revenue bonds, the Park and Harbor Commission raised funds to promote tourism and to undertake a number of civic improvements. These included buying and restoring the American Fur Company warehouse and Stuart House, planting lilacs along the boardwalk, and planting cedar hedges between Mahoney Street and the Borough Lot. The Depression extended through World War II on Mackinac Island, as wartime travel restrictions continued to limit tourism, and the relief provided by New Deal projects came to a halt.

When tourism recovered after World War II, it took on a different character than in the years before the Depression. The summer resort of the 1920s essentially continued a late Victorian lifestyle in late Victorian buildings. But the lifestyle of the 1950s was different. The U.S. economy was booming, and Michigan—led by the auto industry—was especially prosperous. A new state tourism campaign was designed to draw vacationers to northern Michigan. Automobiles were by far the most common mode of travel to Mackinac Island, though the final stretch was still by ferry (or occasionally airplane), and on the island transportation was by foot, bicycle, or horse.¹⁰ When the Mackinac Bridge opened in 1957, it brought even more automobile tourists to the straits region. It was so much faster and easier to reach the island that day trips became popular. Economic recovery meant that empty stores, homes, and hotels were reoccupied. A new post office and medical center built in the 1950s on Market Street (extant, not in district) represented investment in new civic infrastructure. When a new school (7846 Huron) was built on the west end in 1961, it was a milestone in island history, enabling schoolchildren to move out of the Indian Dormitory that had served as the school since 1867.

Mackinac Island's tourist-based economy has continued to grow since the 1960s—today approximately 760,000 people visit the island each year. There has been infill development in the village and some large-scale development on other parts of the island. Yet history, more than ever, is a key element in Mackinac Island's appeal. Today the state park encompasses at least 83 percent of the island. Fort Mackinac, which has been systematically restored to its late nineteenth-century appearance, is a premier attraction. The state park commission has acquired and restored many of the island's most important historic buildings, including the Edward Biddle House, Mission Church, Indian Dormitory, Mission House, and McGulpin House. The hotels and cottages that were once modern and fashionable are now historic and fashionable. Visitors who travel from the docks to the Grand Hotel, as many do, see a slice of island history when they pass through the west end.

SIGNIFICANCE OF THE DISTRICT

Michigan's *Local Historic Districts Act*, PA 169 of 1970, as amended, requires local historic district study committees to be guided by the evaluation criteria for the National Register of Historic Places in evaluating the significance of historic resources. The act also requires study committees to be guided by any criteria established or approved by the Michigan State Historic Preservation Office (Section 3(1)(c)). In 2002, the State Historic Preservation Office issued criteria that elaborate on historic district boundary determinations and single resource districts.

¹⁰ Steamboat and railroad service ended in the 1960s.

In accordance with these legal documents and guidelines, the study committee has determined that the West End Historic District is significant under National Register Criterion A, for its association with historical events that have contributed significantly to the history of Mackinac Island, the state of Michigan, and the United States; and under Criterion C, for its embodiment of the distinctive characteristics of architectural types, periods, and method of construction. The areas of significance are architecture, entertainment/recreation, and ethnic heritage. The period of significance is from ca. 1816, the date of the first building in the district, to 1961.

The National Register Criteria

The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:

A. That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

Mackinac Island, in its entirety, has been designated a National Historic Landmark for its outstanding significance as a military outpost, fur trade depot, and—since the mid-nineteenth century—one of the country’s premier tourist destinations. The development of the west end of the village has been overshadowed by more conspicuous development in the original village and on the east and west bluffs, yet the west end is an integral part of Mackinac Island history. The west end functioned as a largely residential adjunct to the business district in the original village. The major themes of Mackinac Island history are all represented in the west end, beginning with the early nineteenth-century log homes of fur traders. In the mid-nineteenth century, workers in the fishing industry built homes in the west end, including a majority of the Irish immigrants on the island. In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, when tourism became predominant in the island’s economy and life, both workers in the tourist industry and summer residents built homes in the west end. The west end contains both modest and elaborate summer cottages as well as houses that were converted to boardinghouses. A commercial stable represents an essential aspect of life on Mackinac Island. The Little Stone Church (photo 19) served the religious needs of cottagers in the west end and on the East and West Bluffs. The Mackinac Island Public School (photo 20) is an important component of the island’s year-round community of about 460 residents¹¹—an often overlooked aspect of island life.

C. That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

The West End Historic District contains a valuable cross section of the island’s residential architecture. At least two French colonial log buildings survive in the district. The French

¹¹ In 2009, the U.S. Census Bureau’s American Community Survey reported a year-round population of 459 on Mackinac Island.

colonial log buildings of Mackinac Island are rare survivors in the United States. There is a small group in Monroe County, Michigan; few others exist outside of Louisiana and the Mississippi River Valley. The Mackinac Island buildings are more closely related to those in the St. Lawrence River Valley in Canada than to the Creole architecture of Louisiana or Ste. Genevieve, Missouri. They contribute importantly to Mackinac Island's national significance.

The John Biddle House (ca. 1822; photo 8) appears to be the only example of a two-story, side-gabled, side-passage house on the island. This house type, sometimes called a two-thirds Georgian, is an urban type that is not commonly found in rural areas. The John Biddle House is also one of a small number of buildings on the island that date to the 1820s.

The west end contains well-preserved examples of the two-story, front-gabled house—the most common house type on the island. There are some outstanding examples of summer cottages. The Queen Anne-style house at 7566 Huron Street (photo 13) is a textbook example of the style. Corner Cottage (7714 Huron Street; photo 14) is an impressive composition featuring Chippendale balustrade and fluted Doric columns on the front porch; bracketed eaves; and modillion blocks and three types of shingles in the front gable. The Patrick Doud House (7634 Huron Street; photo 15), attributed to noted island builder Patrick Doud, is an eye-catching example of the Shingle Style.

The Little Stone Church (photo 19), one of four churches on the island, is an excellent example of an Early English Gothic Revival church, unique on the island in its fieldstone construction. The church's stained glass windows depict events in island history.

As an ensemble, the West End Historic District is more than the sum of its parts. It is a cohesive neighborhood that is largely intact. The thirteen non-contributing buildings are not overly intrusive. Most of them were constructed after the period of significance and were designed to blend with the area's historic character.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Armour, David A. *100 Years at Mackinac*. Mackinac Island: Mackinac State Historic Parks, 1995.

Busch, Jane C. "Mackinac Island National Historic Landmark Nomination." Washington, D.C.: National Historic Landmarks Survey, 1999.

Gollanek, Eric. "Historic Context Report, City of Mackinac Island Downtown Study Area—Draft." Grand Rapids, 2011.

Porter, Phil. *Mackinac: An Island Famous in These Regions*. Mackinac Island: Mackinac State Historic Parks, 1998.



Photo 1. Huron Street, John Biddle House in foreground, looking west. November 2010.
Photo by Jane Busch.



Photo 2. Cadotte Avenue at Market Street, looking west. December 2010.
All remaining photos by Eric Gollanek.



Photo 3. Market Street at Main (Huron) Street, looking northeast. December 2010.



Photo 4. Mahoney Street, looking northeast. November 2010.



Photo 5. Bourisaw Lane, looking north. November 2010.



Photo 6. William Backhouse Astor House, 1441 Cadotte Avenue, looking south. October 2010.



Photo 7. 1282 Bourisaw Lane, looking east. October 2010.



Photo 8. John Biddle House, 7790 Huron Street, looking northeast. November 2010.



Photo 9. 7664 (left) and 7656 Huron Street, looking north. October 2010.



Photo 10. 7639 Market Street, looking southeast. November 2010.



Photo 11. 7587 Market Street, looking east. November 2010.



Photo 12. 7742 Huron Street, looking east. November 2010.



Photo 13. 7566 Huron Street, looking northeast. October 2010.



Photo 14. Corner Cottage, 7714 Huron Street, looking northeast. October 2010.



Photo 15. Patrick Doud House, 7634 Huron Street, looking northeast. October 2010.



Photo 16. 7790 Huron Street, looking northeast. October 2010.



Photo 17. 7704 Mahoney Street, rear. November 2010.



Photo 18. Jack's Livery Stable, 7754 Mahoney Street, looking northwest. November 2010.



Photo 19. Little Stone Church, 1590 Cadotte Avenue, looking north. December 2010.



Photo 20. Mackinac Island Public School, 7846 Huron Street, looking east. November 2010.